



City Council

Date: Tuesday, 09 November 2021

Time: 18:45

Venue: Cathedral Room

Present: Councillor Ruth Alcroft, Councillor Trevor Allison, Councillor Louise Atkinson, Councillor James Bainbridge, Councillor Robert Betton, Councillor Jeffrey Bomford, Councillor Mrs Marilyn Bowman, Councillor Lisa Brown, Councillor Nigel Christian, Councillor John Collier, Councillor Dr Helen Davison, Councillor Gareth Ellis, Councillor Mrs Christine Finlayson, Councillor Mrs Anne Glendinning, Councillor Colin Glover, Councillor Stephen Higgs, Councillor Neville Lishman, Councillor Mrs Elizabeth Mallinson, Councillor John Mallinson, Councillor Mrs Ann McKerrell, Councillor Keith Meller, Councillor Mrs Linda Mitchell, Councillor Michael Mitchelson, Councillor David Morton, Councillor Paul Nedved, Councillor John Paton, Councillor Ms Lucy Patrick, Councillor Fiona Robson, Councillor David Shepherd, Councillor Miss Lee Sherriff, Councillor Peter Sunter, Councillor Mrs Valerie Tarbitt, Councillor Dr Les Tickner, Councillor Raymond Tinnion, Councillor Miss Jeanette Whalen, Councillor Christopher Wills

Also Present: Deputy Chief Executive
Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services

In the absence of the Mayor, the Deputy Mayor chaired the meeting

C.141/21 Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were submitted on behalf the Mayor (Councillor Pamela Birks), Councillor Ms Jo Ellis-Williams and Councillor Christopher Southward.

C.142/21 Public and Press

RESOLVED – That the Agenda be agreed as circulated.

C.143/21 Minutes

The Mayor moved the receipt and adoption of the minutes of the meeting of the City Council held on 14 September 2021.

RESOLVED - That the minutes of the meeting of the City Council held on 14 September 2021 be received; and were signed by the Mayor.

C.144/21 Declarations of Interest

In accordance with the Council's Code of Conduct the following declarations of interest were submitted:

Councillor Brown declared an interest in respect of item 15.- Notice of Motion. The interest related to her employment at an affordable food hub.

Councillor Dr Tickner declared an interest in respect of item 15. - Notice of Motion. The interest related to his role as Trustee of Carlisle Community Help and also his role as Trustee of Yewdale Community Centre which had an affordable food hub.

Councillor Dr Tickner also declared that he was a Member of the Standards Committee and would not take part any debate on item 16. - Code of Conduct Complaint.

Councillor Morton declared an interest in respect of item 15. - Notice of Motion. The interest related to his role as Trustee of Belah Community Centre which had an affordable food hub.

Councillor Dr Davison declared an interest in respect of item 15. - Notice of Motion. The interest related to her role as Trustee of Belah Community Centre which had an affordable food hub.

C.145/21 Announcements

(i) The Deputy Mayor

The Deputy Mayor congratulated Councillor Wills on his recent election to the City Council and welcomed him to his first meeting.

(ii) The Leader of the Council

There were no announcements from the Leader of the Council.

(iii) Members of the Executive

There were no announcements from Members of the Executive.

(iv) Deputy Chief Executive

There were no announcements from the Deputy Chief Executive.

C.146/21 Questions by Members of the Public

Pursuant to Procedure Rule 10.1, the Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services to report that no questions have been submitted on notice by members of the public.

C.147/21 Presentation of Petitions and Deputations

Pursuant to Procedure Rule 10.11, the Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services reported that no petitions or deputations had been submitted by members of the public.

C.148/21 Questions from Members of the Council

Pursuant to Procedure Rule 11.2, the Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services reported that the following question was submitted on notice by Councillor Alcroft:

"Given the importance of the COP 26 climate talks in Glasgow, can the portfolio holder advise on progress against Carlisle's own climate change strategy, including any updates since the document was published on the council website in April this year?"

The Environment and Transport responded that Carlisle City Council had started the process of electrifying the fleet with two cars, two vans, an ATV and sweeper, electric hand tools had been purchased for the grounds maintenance team and two e-bikes which staff were being encouraged to use on short journeys.

The Council had rolled out double EV charging points to eleven locations across the City and were due to deploy eight more, giving 38 charging points in total.

The Council had also conducted a 'soft market testing exercise' to help develop ideas for EV charging infrastructure. This drew more than 20 interested parties and allowed interviews across a broad range of potential partners. The Council was now considering options for increasing charging capacity at the depot and other locations, including car parks. It was working with the Energy Savings Trust Consultancy to establish future needs for EV's and expected electricity supply requirements..

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder explained that the conversion of footway lighting to LED's had saved around 93tpa in Greenhouse Gas emissions.

He reported that the Council had engaged with Cumbria County Council on the Carlisle Cycling and Walking Infrastructure Plan which was out to public consultation. This was a 'game changer' for managing travel around the city and the Portfolio Holder asked Members to respond to the consultation. In addition the City Council had engaged with the County Council on the re-development of the Citadel Station, to make it more user friendly for cyclists and pedestrians as well as making rail journeys to and from Carlisle a more attractive option. The Portfolio Holder was very pleased that the Borders Rail Campaign now had funding for a feasibility study and thanked all who supported it.

Through the Cumbria Strategic Waste Partnership the Council was looking at the future of waste collection and recycling in light of the pending Environment Act and the proposed Deposit Return Scheme and Extended Producer Responsibility scheme. Through the Borderlands scheme the Council was working with partners to promote digital connectivity, The Natural Capital Innovation Zone and the Borderlands Energy Masterplan for Green Energy.

The City Council had published a Supplementary Planning Document for the Garden Village, which was a fully planned extension to Carlisle, starting with the Park and with facilities and services planned from the start. It was very clear that the Council aimed for a healthy, low carbon, green environment and were in the process of commissioning a Smart Technical Study aimed at providing a roadmap to achieving net zero carbon.

In respect to City Council buildings, work on the new Pools was well advanced and was expected to reduce the leisure services carbon footprint by around 8.5%. Of course some of that gain, perhaps all of it, would be lost if new plant was constructed to raise heat and steam for the Victorian Health Suite. The Portfolio Holder asked those who supported the resurrection of the Victorian Health Suite to really consider if this was the right thing to do.

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder drew attention to the redevelopment of the Council Chamber which had been forced by an unprecedented flood event, but also enabled a reduction in the Council's carbon footprint. He reported that the Council had applied for

Public Sector Decarbonisation Scheme Funding to further decarbonise Council buildings (Heat Pumps etc).

The Council's Capital Programme showed that the cremators were due for replacement this year. Advice had been considered from consultants on the potential to replace the current gas-powered cremators with electric power. This would reduce gas usage by nearly 45% and the Council's total carbon footprint by up to 8.5%. An options paper would be brought forward in due course.

The Portfolio Holder ended by explained that the Council had engaged with students of the University of Northumbria to assist with a public engagement strategy and work was ongoing. He also highlighted that the Strategy would be scrutinised in April 2022.

In accordance with Procedure Rule 11.6, Councillor Alcroft asked the Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder how the Council would engage with the public given that the Executive were reluctant to hold a Citizens Jury despite financial support being available from the Zero Carbon Cumbria Partnership.

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder responded that the Council was in the process of developing a public engagement strategy. Regarding the Citizens Jury, the Portfolio Holder had confidence that everyone was aware of the serious climate emergency and the devastating impact on the future. He felt that the Council and government did not need to be told about climate change from a Citizens Jury to be able to address the issues. He highlighted the democratic process which ensured that no course of action would be taken without public support. He stated that everyone could take action in addressing climate change through their own decisions by choosing different ways to travel, eat and heat homes.

He supported the work of the Zero Carbon Cumbria Partnership and acknowledged that they had allocated £20,000 to each authority for Citizens Jurys, however, they did require a further £10,000 from each authority. The Portfolio Holder felt that the money could be used to reach much wider public engagement than that proposed through the Citizens Jurys.

C.149/21 Minutes of the Executive

Councillor Mallinson (J) moved and Councillor Ellis seconded that the Minutes of the meetings of the Executive held on 27 September 2021 and 25 October 2021 be received and adopted.

RESOLVED – That the Minutes of the meetings of the Executive held on 27 September 2021 and 25 October 2021 be received and adopted.

C.150/21 Executive - Portfolio Holder Reports

Copies of reports from the following Portfolio Holders had been circulated prior to the meeting:

C.151/21 Culture, Heritage and Leisure

The Culture, Heritage and Leisure Portfolio Holder thanked all those involved in another excellent and successful City of Lights event, he gave particular praise to the stewards at the event.

The Culture, Heritage and Leisure Portfolio Holder moved his report and answered Members questions on details of his report.

RESOLVED - That the report of the Culture, Heritage and Leisure Portfolio Holder be received.

C.152/21 Communities, Health and Wellbeing

The Communities, Health and Wellbeing Portfolio Holder reported that the Knife Angel sculpture would be in Carlisle City Centre for the month of December.

The Communities, Health and Wellbeing Portfolio Holder moved her report and responded to Members questions on details of her report.

RESOLVED - That the report of the Communities, Health and Wellbeing Portfolio Holder be received.

C.153/21 Environment and Transport

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder moved his report and responded to Members questions on details of his report.

RESOLVED - That the report of the Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder be received.

C.154/21 Economy, Enterprise and Housing

The Economy, Enterprise and Housing Portfolio Holder reported that, although final confirmation had not arrived, it was probable that Carlisle would be successful in its application to Sustainable Warmth Competition (LAD Phase 3 and Home Upgrade Grants (HUG)). In addition the Council had secured funding from the Homelessness Prevention Grant to support private renters to avoid eviction and the Gas Safety Scheme for vulnerable home owners. he thanked the Homlessness Team for securing the funds.

The Economy, Enterprise and Housing Portfolio Holder moved his report and responded to Members questions on details of his report.

RESOLVED - That the report of the Economy, Enterprise and Housing Portfolio Holder be received.

C.155/21 Finance, Governance and Resources

The Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder thanked all those involved in the successful prosecution for animal cruelty and breaches of dog breeding and dog day care licences. The Council takes its licensing responsibilities very seriously and the prosecution highlighted the serious issue of animal welfare and illegal puppy farming.

The Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder moved his report and responded to questions on the details of his report.

RESOLVED - That the report of the Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder be received.

C.156/21 Leader

The Leader moved his report.

RESOLVED - That the report of the Leader be received.

C.157/21 Amendments to Council Procedure Rules

Consideration was given to a report of the Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services (GD.69/21) seeking an amendment to Council Procedure Rule (CPR) 17 as regards methodology of voting. The report also proposed the removal of CPR 27 which related to Virtual meetings.

A Member noted the removal of the virtual meetings procedure rules with disappointment. He felt that a requirement to travel into meetings did not support the Council's climate change agenda and questioned whether a ?? approach could be taken.

The Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder clarified the legislation regarding Members attendance at meeting and highlighted a number of non formal meetings which could continue in a virtual manner.

The Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder moved the recommendations and the Leader seconded them.

RESOLVED - That Council amend its Council procedure Rules as set out in report GD.69/21 and particularly:

1. CPR 17.3 be amended to read as set out in paragraph 1.5.1: and
2. CPR 27 relating to virtual meetings was deleted.

C.158/21 Minutes

The Deputy Mayor moved and Councillor Bainbridge seconded receipt and adoption of the minutes of the meetings as detailed within Minute Book Volume 48(3):

Committee	Meeting Date
Health and Wellbeing Scrutiny Panel	2 September 2021
Business and Transformation Scrutiny Panel	26 August and 7 October 2021
Economic Growth Scrutiny Panel	9 September 2021 and 21 October 2021
Regulatory Panel	22 September 2021
Development Control Committee	8 September and 10 September 2021

Audit Committee	24 September 2021
Standards Committee	20 September 2021
Employment Panel	14 September 2021
Appeals Panel	5 October 2021

RESOLVED - That the minutes of the meetings as detailed above be received and adopted.

C.159/21 Scrutiny

Copies of reports from the following Scrutiny Panel Chairs had been circulated prior to the meeting:

C.160/21 Vice Chair of the Health and Wellbeing Scrutiny Panel

Councillor Mrs Finlayson moved her Vice Chair's Report.

RESOLVED – That the Report of the Vice Chair be received and adopted.

C.161/21 Chair of the Business and Transformation Scrutiny Panel

Councillor Bainbridge moved his Chair's Report.

RESOLVED – That the Report of the Chair be received and adopted.

C.162/21 Chair of Economic Growth Scrutiny Chair

Councillor Brown moved her Chair's Report.

RESOLVED – That the Report of the Chair be received and adopted.

C.163/21 Notice of Motion

Pursuant to Procedure Rule 12, the Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services reported the receipt of the following motion submitted on notice by Councillor Brown.

"This Council believes that the Covid-19 pandemic has only served to exasperate levels of poverty and food insecurity amongst Children and Adults in both its urban and rural wards. We note the exemplary work of the local authority during the pandemic but fear much more needs to be done to address the immediate crisis of food insecurity.

According to data collected by No Child Left Behind, 4,469 children are living in poverty in Carlisle. School staff, youth workers and community workers in Carlisle report families struggling financially, unable to afford uniform, children (from families both in work and out of

work) coming to school or youth groups hungry.

Figures for Cumbria now show 10,692 children receiving Free School Meals but as the thresholds for eligibility are so low, Child Tax Credit and an annual gross income of no more than £16,190 or Universal Credit household income must be less than £7,400 a year, those just above the threshold are struggling with no support. With the Government cutting the Universal Credit uplift approx 8,871 families in Carlisle will be worse off, not only risking pushing these families into further food insecurity, but taking millions out of our local economy.

The right to food is a fundamental human right, enshrined in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights adopted by the United Nations. People have the right to eat with dignity and with choice, and not only have the right to food, but to good food.

Therefore, we commit this council to the following actions.

1. To join Councils in Liverpool, Manchester, Greater Manchester Combined Authority, Liverpool Combined Authority, Rotherham, Brighton and Hove, Haringey, St Helens, Newcastle, Portsmouth by declaring Carlisle a Right to Food City and formally support the Right to Food Campaign started by Fans Supporting Food Banks
2. Calls on the Chief Executive to write to our MP's and ask them to actively campaign to enshrine a Right to Food in UK law: universal free school meals; community kitchens; reasonable portions in benefits and wages; ensured food security; and independent enforcement, as recognised by the UN, bringing the country into line with the best international practice.
3. Calls on Carlisle City Council Executive, Officers and Scrutiny Panels to support local recognition of food poverty and insecurity as issues demanding priority action; to pledge to measure annually food insecurity in Carlisle as a whole; develop and work with communities to understand need accurately; to develop robust emergency planning for future crises which challenge food insecurity; scrutinise the availability of healthy food vs. junk food in local areas; consider local transport and accessibility to healthy food outlets; People in the community (in receipt of help) should be the ones who drive the emergence of an actual plan, rather than one being imposed.
4. Sign the Glasgow Food and Climate Declaration - A commitment by subnational governments to tackle the climate emergency through integrated food policies and a call on national governments to act."

Councillor Brown moved and Councillor Patrick seconded the motion.

Councillor Brown then elaborated upon the reasons for the submission of the motion, which she hoped would receive the backing of the Council.

Substantial debate ensued, during which various Members expressed their support for / opposition to the amendment; and advice was sought regarding Members declarations of interests.

Following the debate Councillor Patrick gave consideration to the comments made and Pursuant to Procedure Rule 14.6 Councillor Patrick gave notice of an alteration to the Motion. She amended the Motion by removing the final paragraph:

Delete - 4. Sign the Glasgow Food and Climate Declaration - A commitment by subnational governments to tackle the climate emergency through integrated food policies and a call on national governments to act.

Amended Motion to read:

"This Council believes that the Covid-19 pandemic has only served to exasperate levels of poverty and food insecurity amongst Children and Adults in both its urban and rural wards. We note the exemplary work of the local authority during the pandemic but fear much more needs to be done to address the immediate crisis of food insecurity.

According to data collected by No Child Left Behind, 4,469 children are living in poverty in Carlisle. School staff, youth workers and community workers in Carlisle report families struggling financially, unable to afford uniform, children (from families both in work and out of work) coming to school or youth groups hungry.

Figures for Cumbria now show 10,692 children receiving Free School Meals but as the thresholds for eligibility are so low, Child Tax Credit and an annual gross income of no more than £16,190 or Universal Credit household income must be less than £7,400 a year, those just above the threshold are struggling with no support. With the Government cutting the Universal Credit uplift approx 8,871 families in Carlisle will be worse off, not only risking pushing these families into further food insecurity, but taking millions out of our local economy.

The right to food is a fundamental human right, enshrined in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights adopted by the United Nations. People have the right to eat with dignity and with choice, and not only have the right to food, but to good food.

Therefore, we commit this council to the following actions.

1. To join Councils in Liverpool, Manchester, Greater Manchester Combined Authority, Liverpool Combined Authority, Rotherham, Brighton and Hove, Haringey, St Helens, Newcastle, Portsmouth by declaring Carlisle a Right to Food City and formally support the Right to Food Campaign started by Fans Supporting Food Banks
2. Calls on the Chief Executive to write to our MP's and ask them to actively campaign to enshrine a Right to Food in UK law: universal free school meals; community kitchens; reasonable portions in benefits and wages; ensured food security; and independent enforcement, as recognised by the UN, bringing the country into line with the best international practice.
3. Calls on Carlisle City Council Executive, Officers and Scrutiny Panels to support local recognition of food poverty and insecurity as issues demanding priority action; to pledge to measure annually food insecurity in Carlisle as a whole; develop and work with communities to understand need accurately; to develop robust emergency planning for future crises which challenge food insecurity; scrutinise the availability of healthy food vs. junk food in local areas; consider local transport and accessibility to healthy food outlets; People in the community (in receipt of help) should be the ones who drive the emergence of an actual plan, rather than one being imposed."

Councillor Patrick moved and Councillor Brown seconded the amendment.

Following voting, the amendment to the original Motion was CARRIED.

Following further voting, the substantive Motion, FELL.

RESOLVED - That the Motion of Councillor Brown FELL.

C.164/21 Code of Conduct Complaint - Councillor Ellis

Pursuant to Minutes ST.13/21 and ST.15/21, consideration was given to a report of the Chair of the Standards Committee and Monitoring Officer setting out the decision of the Standards Committee following their consideration of two Code of Conduct Complaints.

The Chair of the Standards Committee moved her report and responded to Members questions on details of her report.

RESOLVED - That Council received and noted the decisions of the Standards Committee (GD.75/21).

C.165/21 Community Governance Review

Consideration was given to a report of the Corporate Director of Governance and Regulatory Services (GD.80/21) regarding the potential exploration to undertake a Community Governance Review (CGR) and to set up a working group to consider the practicalities and potential timescales and terms of reference for any such review for reporting back to Council.

The Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder supported the establishment of Charter Trustees for the Carlisle area and moved that Council did not carry out a wider Community Governance Review, continue with the Stanwix Community Governance Review and request that the Shadow Council / new Council carry out a Community Governance Review. The recommendation was seconded by the Leader.

RESOLVED - That Council

a) advises the Department for Levelling Up, Housing and Communities that it supports the establishment of Charter Trustees for the Carlisle area to protect the City's civic history and identity; and

b) did not carry out a wider Community Governance Review, continues with the Stanwix Community Governance review and requests that the Shadow Council / new Council carries out a Community Governance Review.

C.166/21 Appointment of Chair

Pursuant to Minute AP.01/21, and in accordance with Procedure Rule 7.3, the Council was asked to appoint a Chair of the Appeals Panel 3 for the 2021/22 Municipal year.

The Leader moved Councillor Mrs Mallinson as Chair and Councillor Dr Tickner seconded the nomination.

RESOLVED - That Councillor Mrs Mallinson be appointed the Chair of the Appeals Panel 3 for the 2021/22 Municipal Year.

C.167/21 Committee Nominations

RESOLVED - The City Council noted and approved the following nominations for changes to committee membership:

Labour Group:

Development Control Committee

Councillor Brown to replace Councillor Miss Whalen as a full Member

Councillor Patrick to replace Councillor Brown as a substitute Member

C.168/21 Communications

There were no communications or items of business brought forward by the Mayor as a matter of urgency to be dealt with at the meeting.

The Meeting ended at: 21:48