



COMMUNITY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL

Panel Report

Public

Date of Meeting: 10th January 2013

Title: CCTV

Report of: The Director of Local Environment

Report reference: LE 01/13

Summary:

This report provides a summary of the transformation proposals for 2013/14 in relation to the provision of Closed Circuit Television (CCTV). The CCTV savings proposals seek to find transformational savings of £180,000. This report discusses options for achieving the required savings. The report recommends that the Council cease the active monitoring of CCTV but retain cameras in both the City Centre Car Parks and those that are most used for crime and disorder. These cameras will be maintained by the City Council and automatically record images.

Questions for / input required from Scrutiny:

Recommendations:

That the Overview & Scrutiny Panel discuss the proposal to:

1. Discontinue active monitoring the CCTV system.
2. Reduce the number of cameras and restructure the CCTV service, retaining 9 car park cameras, 20 internal Civic Centre Cameras in line with Option 2
3. Subject to available budget, retain 6 City Centre Cameras for the next financial year only to enable further negotiations with partners to agree financial support for the continuance of these cameras.
4. Delegate authority to the Director of Local Environment in consultation with the Portfolio Holder to conclude these negotiations.

Contact Officer: Angela Culleton

Ext: 7325

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND OPTIONS

- 1.1 A Closed Circuit Television (CCTV) system has been in place in Carlisle since 1995 and includes 47 fully functioning PTZ (Pan, Tilt and Zoom) cameras and 13 static cameras. The CCTV control room, based in the Civic Centre, also monitors 10 cameras at Boustead's Grassing, 2 at Hammond's Pond and 1 at Bitts Park, plus a further 20 internal cameras within the Civic Centre. The control room can view 11 privately-owned cameras within The Lanes and English Gate Plaza, Botchergate. Most City Council car parks, the city centre retail area and the pubs/clubs on Botchergate are covered by CCTV. On behalf of the Crime Disorder Reduction Partnership, five re-deployable cameras can also be viewed by the CCTV operator.
- 1.2 The technical equipment was upgraded to a digital recording system in 2006, and there are communication links with partners. The control room has two separate CCTV video links to Cumbria Police (Carleton Hall and Durrhill), so the Police are able to view incidents directly and if required, can download footage onto DVDs for evidential purposes. The Police have two 24 hour control rooms located at the Cumbria Police Head Quarters at Carleton Hall, Penrith and Workington, but these are call handling and dispatch centres with limited access to CCTV camera images.
- 1.3 At present the City Council control room is single manned Monday to Friday 0945 to 0200 hours and Friday to Sunday 1045 to 0300 hours. The cameras record 24 hours, seven days per week. There are three permanent CCTV operators each employed for 21.45 hours per week and one full time 37 hours per week CCTV Supervisor. The CCTV Supervisor Post is temporary until August 2013.
- 1.4 A saving of £180,000 has been proposed as part of the 2013/2014 revenue budget. It is hoped to retain the cameras in the City Council owned car parks in addition to random remote patrolling and a retained facility for recording footage. No external partner organisation contributes to the CCTV system.
- 1.5 Although the total net expenditure for CCTV is £353,900 only £232,400 relates to saveable employee, supplies and services codes. The remainder is for accommodation and support recharges and capital depreciation costs which will remain with the Council.
- 1.6 To achieve the required savings a significant scale down of the CCTV system will be required. Some of the supplies and services costs for 2013/14 are committed, for

example a contract exists with British Telecom for the fibre optic connections valued at £45,000.

- 1.7 Four options for a continued CCTV system are put forward to the Executive for consideration and these are listed in table.1. Option 1 is the complete removal of CCTV. However, the Civic Centre cameras and recording facilities would be removed in this option. The other 3 options propose a reduced CCTV system which records and saves images for 28 days but there is no operative monitoring in real time by Council employees, although the facility to do so will be retained at the Civic Centre Control room and the Durranhill Police Station. The prices shown in table 1 are estimates so prices may come in higher than estimates. Therefore, the transformation savings expected should remain at £180,000 to allow some contingency for higher pricing. If actual costs exceed estimates significantly, the retained monitoring provision would need to be scaled back so that transformation savings targets are achieved.

Table 1. The Cost of Providing the Four Options for CCTV^{*1}

	Communication cost (Fibre Optic / IP) £	Maintenance cost £	Electricity Cost £	Total Cost £	Total Saving 2015/16 ^{*2} £
OPTION 1					
Full Withdrawal from CCTV	NA	NA	NA	NA	232,400
OPTION 2					
20 internal Civic Centre Cameras and 9 cameras on City Council Car Parks	4,800	300 9,400	2,700	17,200	215,200
OPTION 3					
20 internal Civic Centre Cameras and 6 Crime and Disorder Cameras	3,600	300 6,300	2,700	12,900	219,500
OPTION 4					
20 internal Civic Centre Cameras and 9 cameras on City Council Car Parks and 6 Crime and Disorder Cameras	8,400	16,000	2,700	27,100	205,300

^{*1} Prices are estimates from existing suppliers, actual figures maybe subject to a procurement process.

^{*2}Capital money will be required to remove cameras and it would be advised that some of the savings should be put aside for any future equipment replacement. Some costs for 2013/14 are committed, for example a contract exists with British Telecom for the fibre optic connections valued at £45,000 so the full savings will not be achieved until 2015/16.

- 1.8 Option 4, subject to a necessary procurement process, should achieve the desired savings whilst also providing a CCTV Service that both satisfies the Council's requirements and also continues to contribute to the work of crime and disorder partnerships. Option 1 leaves the internal Civic Centre cameras without maintenance. Options 2 and 3 whilst delivering the required savings is not as effective as Option 4, as neither the needs of the Council or its partners are fully achieved. Car park crime has been reducing since its peak in the 1990s when the

CCTV system was initially commissioned by the City Council. From a crime and disorder perspective it is only a small number of cameras that have proved to be effective and most of these are within the City Centre and cover the night time economy. Option 4 full fills both the desire to monitor the Council Car Parks and also provides coverage over most of the significant potential incident areas in the City Council's boundary. Option 4 is the most effective and efficient option as it provides both a deterrent and a means to collect evidence whilst also achieving the required savings. The Council has sought offers for monitoring the CCTV system but to date no partner has come forward.

- 1.9 Further negotiations with partners are required to agree funding to retain the 6 cameras identified which most support reduction of crime and disorder. If funding can be agreed then these cameras can be retained into the future, therefore, a further period of time is required to complete these negotiations.

2. CONSULTATION

2.1 Consultation to Date.

Notifications and discussions regarding the savings identified from the CCTV System have occurred between the City Council and Cumbria Constabulary; Carlisle & Eden Crime and Disorder Reduction Partnership; Riverside; The Lanes Shopping Centre; Retailers Against Crime and Pub Watch. This initial consultation has resulted in the options being put forward by these partner organisations.

2.2 Consultation proposed.

A further consultation document will be produced following the recommendations of the Executive.

3. OPTIONS

- 3.1 Option 1 would leave the internal Civic Centre cameras without maintenance. Options 2 and 3 whilst delivering the required savings do not result in a system that can be argued to be effective as the options do not either fulfil the needs of the Council or its partners. Option 4 is the most effective and efficient option as it provides both a deterrent and a means to collect evidence. Despite testing the market no partner has yet come forward to undertake monitoring.

Impact assessments

Does the change have an impact on the following?

Equality Impact Screening	Impact Yes/No?	Is the impact positive or negative?
Does the policy/service impact on the following?		
Age	No	
Disability	No	
Race	No	
Gender/ Transgender	No	
Sexual Orientation	No	
Religion or belief	No	
Human Rights	No	
Health inequalities	No	
Rurality	No	

If you consider there is either no impact or no negative impact, please give reasons:

.....

.....

.....

If an equality Impact is necessary, please contact the P&P team.

Consultation Document for release 28th November 2012

Local Environment- CCTV SAVINGS PROPOSALS

SUMMARY

Carlisle City Council is undergoing a Transformation Programme in order to realise savings of £2.5 Million over four years to bring the Council into a more balanced financial position.

During transformation many aspects of the Council's work are under consideration including the City Council's Closed Circuit Television System (CCTV). Reduced funding in the Local Environment Directorate means it must refocus on priorities to minimise the impact of reducing resources on front line services that the public value. The new Carlisle Plan has six priorities for the City Council which covers: skills; employment; culture; housing; clean streets and working in partnership.

Previous budget savings have already effected CCTV and meant that consultations and some re-structuring was carried out in 2011 and 2012. It is proposed to further reduce the operational revenue budget of CCTV by £180,000. It is hoped to retain the cameras in the City Council owned car parks in addition to random remote patrolling and a retained facility for recording footage. No external partner organisation contributes to the CCTV system.

A general consultation regarding the savings proposals already began within Local Environment on 16th November which made reference to the CCTV savings proposals. This consultation document provides more detail concerning directly affected staff within the CCTV service.

The re-structure proposals for the CCTV service contained within this report form the basis of formal consultation with staff, Unions, elected members and key stakeholders prior to final SMT approval in January 2013, with changes coming into place no later than 1st April 2013.

PROPOSALS FOR CHANGE

CCTV revenue operating costs relate to staffing and management costs, essential overtime, equipment maintenance and transmission costs. In order to achieve the proposed savings the level of CCTV monitoring must be reduced. Some of the supplies and services costs for 2013/14 are committed, for example a contract exists with British Telecom for the fibre optic connections valued at £45,000.

The Executive have taken the decision to discontinue the service of monitoring the CCTV system and restructure the CCTV service so that 9 car park cameras, 6 City Centre Cameras and 20 internal Civic Centre cameras are maintained by the City Council. During the consultation period and potentially the next financial year, negotiations will continue

with partner organisations such as the police to agree financial support for the 6 City Centre Cameras.

The reduced CCTV system will record and save images for 28 days. Although there is no operative monitoring in real time by Council employees, the facility to do so will be retained at the Civic Centre Control room and the Durranshill Police Station.

The proposal, subject to a necessary procurement process, should achieve the desired savings whilst also providing a CCTV Service that both satisfies the Council's requirements and also continues to contribute to the work of crime and disorder partnerships. Car park crime has been reducing since its peak in the 1990s when the CCTV system was initially commissioned by the City Council. From a crime and disorder perspective it is only a small number of cameras that have proved to be effective and most of these are within the City Centre and cover the night time economy. The proposal full fills both the desire to monitor the Council Car Parks and also provides coverage over most of the significant potential incident areas in the City Council's boundary. It is the most effective and efficient option as it provides both a deterrent and a means to collect evidence whilst also achieving the required savings. The Council has sought offers for monitoring the CCTV system but to date no partner has come forward.

The current CCTV service is manned by part time staff working a shift system. The initial consultation with the police has shown that the biggest demand for CCTV services tends to be in the evening at the weekend. The proposal to cease real time monitoring of the CCTV will mean the deletion of the following posts:

Table 1

Job Title	Posts
CCTV Shift Supervisor	1.00
CCTV Shift Operator	0.58
CCTV Shift Operator	0.58
CCTV Shift Operator	0.58
CCTV Shift Operator (vacant)	0.58
CCTV Shift Operator	0.22
TOTAL POSTS TO BE DELETED	3.54

Formal consultation will begin on the 28th November 2012 and this report forms the basis of that consultation. The consultation timetable is set out in Table 2. Staff affected by the changes will be offered a 1 to 1 meeting with their manager and an HR advisor to discuss concerns and options for the future.

The coordination and management of the City Council's remaining interests in the CCTV system will be carried out by the Enforcement and Education team leader.

IMPLEMENTATION AND NEXT STEPS

The proposals are for consultation. The intention is to undertake the following phases of work:

- Conduct formal consultation with Trades Unions, staff and key service users. (November 2012 to January 2013)
- Amend proposals (January 2013)
- SMT approval for amended proposals January 2012
- Implementation by 1st April 2013 at the latest

CONSULTATION QUERIES

- The City Council will be interested in partners coming forward to contribute or take direct responsibility for those cameras which it no longer intends to maintain (appendix.2.)
- The City Council is interested to receive views on whether the resources it is intending to retain within CCTV are being allocated most effectively.
- The Council would be interested in proposals to monitor the remaining CCTV system.

CONSULTATION TIMETABLE FOR CCTV PROPOSED CHANGES.

(November 2012 to April 2013)

	Proposed consultation on CCTV savings and efficiency review		
		start	finish
1	DMT workshop		
2	SMT meeting to approve principles and timetable of media plan	27//11/12	
3	Staff consultations	28/11/12	4/1/13
a	Team meeting with Union	30/11/12	4/1/13
b	Letters giving formal consultation period	30/11/12	4/1/13
c	1 to 1 meetings with manager and HR	30/11/12	4/1/13
4.	Partner consultation	30/11/12	4/1/13
a	Announcement to partners	30/11/12	4/1/13
b	Formal consultation	30/11/12	4/1/13

5	Email letter to all councillors	30/11/12	4/1/13
6	JMT consultation (via email)	30/11/12	4/1/13
7	Union consultation	30/11/12	4/1/13
8	Final SMT approval of amended proposals	8/1/13	
9	Proposed implementation of revised arrangements	asap	

EXCERPT FROM THE MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE HELD ON 19 NOVEMBER 2012

EX.156/12 REVIEW OF CCTV PROVISION IN CARLISLE (Key Decision – KD.036/12)

(Public and Press excluded by virtue of Paragraph 3)

Portfolio Environment and Transport

Relevant Overview and Scrutiny Panel Community

Subject Matter

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder submitted private report LE.37/12 concerning the review of CCTV provision in Carlisle.

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder outlined the background to and reasons for the review, together with the options open for consideration by the Executive. She added that option 4 was the most effective and efficient option as it provided both a deterrent and a means to collect evidence.

Referring to recommendation 3, the Portfolio Holder expressed the hope that future consultation with partners would be positive in nature.

In conclusion, the Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder moved the recommendations, which were duly seconded by the Finance, Governance and Resources Portfolio Holder.

Summary of options rejected Other options detailed within private Report LE.37/12

DECISION

That the Executive approved the proposal to:

1. Discontinue active monitoring of the CCTV system.
2. Reduce the number of cameras and restructure the CCTV service, retaining 9 car park cameras, 20 internal Civic Centre Cameras in line with Option 2.
3. Subject to available budget, retain 6 City Centre Cameras for the next financial year only to enable further negotiations with partners to agree financial support for the continuance of those cameras.
4. Delegated authority to the Director of Local Environment in consultation with the Portfolio Holder to conclude those negotiations.

Reasons for Decision

As set out within Report LE.37/12