

## Agenda Item: A.2(a)

**CARLISLE**  
CITY COUNCIL



[www.carlisle.gov.uk](http://www.carlisle.gov.uk)

# ENVIRONMENT & ECONOMY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL

## *Panel Report*

### Public

**Date of Meeting:** 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012

**Title:** Overview Report and Work Programme

**Report of:** Overview and Scrutiny Officer

**Report reference:** OS 32/12

### **Summary:**

This report provides an overview of matters related to the Environment & Economy O&S Panel's work. It also includes the latest version of the work programme.

### **Recommendations:**

Members are asked to:

- Decide whether the items on the Leader's Forward Plan should be included in the Panel's Work Programme for consideration. (para 1 & Appendix 1)
- Note and/or amend the Panel's work programme (Appendix 2)

**Contact Officer:** Nicola Edwards

**Ext:** 7122

## 1. Notice of Key Executive Decisions

The most recent Notice of Key Executive Decisions was published on 16<sup>th</sup> November 2012. The following issues fall into the remit of this Panel and full details are attached at **Appendix 1**:

**KD.033/12 Budget Process 2012/13** – *to be considered at this meeting of the Panel.*

## 2. References from the Executive

The follow references have been received from the Executive and are attached at **Appendix 2** for information:

EX.122/12 – Higher Level Stewardship Grant

EX.131/12 – Highways Claimed Rights

## 3. Scrutiny Chairs Group

A meeting of the Scrutiny Chairs Group was held on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2012. Draft notes of the meeting at attached at **Appendix 3** for information and/or comment.

## 4. Work Programme

The Panel's work programme has been amended accordingly and can be found at **Appendix 4**.

Items relevant to the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel:

**Notice of Key Decisions to be taken by the Executive**

The following key decision is to be made on behalf of Carlisle City Council:

Key Decision Reference:	KD.033/12
Decision Title:	Budget Process 2013/14
Decision to be taken:	<p>The Executive will be asked to consider strategic financial issues arising from the budget setting process:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) Budget Update - Revenue Estimates (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(b) Individual Charges Reviews (Local Environment, Governance , Economic Development, Community Engagement) (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(c) New Revenue Spending Proposals (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(d) New Savings Proposals (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(e) New Capital Spending Proposals and Provisional Capital Programme (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(f) Repair and Maintenance (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(g) Treasury Management and Prudential Borrowing Implications (19th November 2012)</li> <li>(h) Consideration of Overview and Scrutiny Consultation feedback (13th December 2012)</li> <li>(i) Draft Revenue Support Grant Settlement (if available) (17th December 2012)</li> <li>(j) Summary Overall Revenue and Capital Position (17th December 2012)</li> <li>(k) Draft Treasury Management and Investment Strategy including MRP Strategy (17th December 2012)</li> <li>(l) Executive Draft Budget Proposals for consultation (17th December 2012)</li> <li>(m) Final Revenue Support Grant and Final Revenue Budget Summary (14th January 2013)</li> <li>(n) Provisional Capital Programme (14th January 2013)</li> <li>(o) Treasury Management and Investment Strategy including MRP Strategy (14th January 2013)</li> <li>(p) Consideration of Final Budget Consultation (16th January 2013)</li> <li>(q) Executive's Final Budget Proposals (16th January 2013).</li> </ul>
Date Decision to be considered:	19 November 2012, 13 December 2012, 17 December 2012 and 14 January 2013 consultation period to include Overview and Scrutiny as appropriate
Date Decision to be taken:	19 November 2012, 13 December 2012, 17 December 2012 and 14 January 2013
Is the Decision Public or Private?:	The decision will be taken in public.

## Items relevant to the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel:

Documents submitted for consideration in relation to the Decision:	The Director of Resource's report will be available five working days before the meeting
Contact Officer for this Decision:	Director of Resources, Carlisle City Council, Civic Centre, Carlisle, CA3 8QG
Relevant Portfolio Area:	Finance, Governance and Resources (Councillor Dr Tickner)
Relevant or Lead Overview and Scrutiny Panel:	Cross cutting

All public reports can be viewed in the Customer Contact centre of the Civic Centre, Carlisle, the Public Library and on the Council's website [www.carlisle.gov.uk](http://www.carlisle.gov.uk).

Other documents relevant to the matter may be submitted to the decision maker. These, if available, may be obtained by contacting the named contact officer.

**EXCERPT FROM THE MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE  
29 OCTOBER 2012**

**EX.122/12     \*\*HIGHER LEVEL STEWARDSHIP GRANT**  
(Key Decision – KD.035/12)

**Portfolio**     Environment and Transport

**Relevant Overview and Scrutiny Panel**     Environment and Economy

**Subject Matter**

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder reported (LE.30/12) that, as a major landowner in the Carlisle area, the City Council qualified for agri-environmental grants in the same way as private farmers.

In the past the grants awarded to the Council included Countryside Stewardship (for agricultural land) and Woodland Grant Scheme (for woodlands). Those agreements were typically for a 10 year period and previous recipient sites included Talkin Tarn. With an annual payment of £22,800 the total for the 10 years of the agreement was £228,000 for both revenue and capital items.

Having come to the end of an Entry Level Scheme for Countryside Stewardship, the Council now qualified for the Higher Level Scheme (HLS) under which the potential payments were increased. Officers had been working for some months, with assistance from Natural England's advisers, to enter as much of the City Council's land as possible into the scheme in order to maximise the value of the grant.

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder drew Members' attention to the complete list of sites for which HLS had been offered. She further outlined the purpose and conditions of the grant; and the levels of payment. The options open to the Council were:

- a.     Do not accept the grant;
- b.     Accept the grant in part; or
- c.     Accept the grant in whole

The Portfolio Holder alluded to the lively debate at the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel meeting on 25 October 2012 (EEO.SP.65/12), when the Panel had resolved:

- “1) That Report LE.36/12 on the Higher Level of Stewardship grant offer be noted.
- 2) That the Panel was supportive of acceptance of the grant in part (Option B) and the views of the Panel be conveyed to the Executive.”

Copies of an Excerpt from the draft Minutes of the meeting had been circulated.

In conclusion, the Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder moved the recommendations, which were duly seconded by the Leader.

**Summary of options rejected**      Options a. and b. set out in Report LE.30/12

## **DECISION**

1.      That the Executive recommended acceptance of the Higher Level Scheme grant to full Council in accordance with the Council's Budget and Policy procedure, and accepted the conditions of grant in full.
  
2.      That the Executive delegated the Director of Local Environment to sign the agreement on behalf of Carlisle City Council.

## **Reasons for Decision**

To enable the Council's Green Spaces Team to improve the management and maintenance of the sites listed within the report.

---

**EXCERPT FROM THE MINUTES OF THE EXECUTIVE**  
**29 OCTOBER 2012**

**EX.131/12    \*\*HIGHWAYS CLAIMED RIGHTS**

(Key Decision – KD.027/12)

(Not for publication by virtue of paragraph 3)

**Portfolio**        Environment and Transport

**Relevant Overview and Scrutiny Panel**    Environment and Economy

**Subject Matter**

Pursuant to Minute EX.119/12, the Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder submitted private report LE.29/12 concerning the review of Highways Claimed Rights (HCR).

The Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder set out the background to the matter reminding Members that since 2001 the City Council had, under Section 42 of the Highways Act 1980, “Claimed Rights” to carry out highways maintenance on all urban unclassified roads in the district.

The City Council had, in conjunction with the County Council, commissioned a consultant to take an independent view on the future of HCR and to report on the options. A copy of the Consultants report was appended.

Details of the three options considered for the future, together with the main conclusions drawn from the study of each option were provided.

The Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel had, on 13 September 2012, considered the matter.

The Chairman of the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel made reference to the very good presentation and discussions which had taken place. He then outlined the recommendations made, namely:

“That the Panel recommend option 2, as set out in report LE.27/12, to the Executive as the preferred option.

The Panel ask that the Executive use their best endeavours to negotiate equal representation for Carlisle City Council on the Cumbria County Council Highways and Transport Working Group.

Councillor Bainbridge abstained from voting on the matter.”

A copy of Minute Excerpt EEOSP.54/12 had been circulated.

Joint meetings between representatives of the City and County Councils had taken place on 12 September and 16 October 2012. Copies of the notes thereof were also provided.

In conclusion, the Environment and Transport Portfolio Holder moved the recommendations set out in the report, which were duly seconded by the Leader.

**Summary of options rejected**      Other options detailed within private report LE.29/12

## **DECISION**

That the Executive had given consideration to the comments of the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel of 13 September 2012; together with the recommendations set out in the Consultant report, attached as Appendix 1 to Report LE.29/12.

1. That the Executive made recommendations to the City Council, in accordance with the Council's Budget and Policy Framework as set out in the report and in agreement with the recommendations of the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel, to support Option 2: terminate the current claimed right to carry out the highways maintenance of all urban unclassified roads in the district and instead work in co-operation with the County Council in the delivery of a residual highways service either
  - (a) on such day as may be agreed between the City Council and the County Council, or
  - (b) six months after the receipt by the County Council of a notice from the City Council stating the intention to cease to exercise those powers.
  
2. Subject to approval by Council, the Executive delegated authority to the Director of Local Environment, in consultation with the Portfolio Holder for Local Environment and the Director of Governance, to agree the terms of the termination; any transitional arrangements; and a new residual Highways Agreement with the County Council with a date for new arrangements to come into place in 2013.

## **Reasons for Decision**

The reasons recorded within private report LE.29/12



## SCRUTINY CHAIRS GROUP MEETING

1 November 2012 at 9.30am

**Attended:** Councillor Whalen, Vice Chairman of the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel (Lead Member)  
Councillor Mrs Luckley, Chairman of the Community Overview and Scrutiny Panel (until 10.20am)  
Councillor Mrs Prest, Vice Chairman of the Community Overview and Scrutiny Panel (from 9.55am)  
Councillor Layden, Chairman of the Environment and Economy Overview and Scrutiny Panel  
Councillor Betton, Vice Chairman of the Resources Overview and Scrutiny Panel (from 10.05am)  
Nicola Edwards, Scrutiny Officer  
Rachel Rooney, Lead Committee Clerk

### 18/12 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

An apology for absence was submitted on behalf of Councillor Watson, Chairman of the Resources Overview and Scrutiny Panel.

### 19/12 MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS

The minutes of the meeting held on 3 July 2012 were considered.

#### *13/12 – Scrutiny of Welfare Reform*

Councillor Whalen informed the Group that he had been researching the impact of the Welfare Reform and had information if any Members required copies. There were a number of issues regarding the Reform and redundancies within Carlisle. The Group welcomed the support being provided by a number of agencies within the City.

AGREED – That the minutes of the Scrutiny Chairs Group held on 3 July 2012 be agreed as a correct record of the meeting.

### 20/12 CIVIC CALENDAR 2013/14

Ms Rooney submitted the draft Civic Calendar for 2013/14 for comment. In previous years there had been an issue with JMT clashing with Overview and Scrutiny Panels. This year the Executive moved the JMT meetings to 4.00pm which eliminated the clash.

There were concerns raised that, although the attendance to Scrutiny meetings had improved, there had been an increase in the number of Members who left part way through the meeting, particularly around noon. The Group felt that the Scrutiny meetings were important and Members should make themselves available to attend the full meetings and they should expect the meetings to last until at least 1.00pm. The Agenda for the meetings would highlight any requirements for lunch etc if the meetings were likely to run in to the afternoon.

AGREED – 1) That the draft dates and times of meetings for 2013/14 be approved.

2) That the concerns of the Group regarding Members of Scrutiny leaving part way through the meetings be highlighted with Group Leaders.

## **21/12 CHAIRS TRAINING**

Councillor Whalen reminded the Group of the Scrutiny Chairs and Vice Chairs Training on Purposeful Meetings which had taken place in July 2012. He asked how the Chairs had used this training and if they had any suggestions for further training.

The Group all felt that the training had been particular useful and continued to use the literature as part of their role. They suggested training for new Members of Scrutiny and asked that opportunities to share training with other authorities be explored further.

They agreed that Task and Finish Groups had been very successful and were a practical way for in depth Scrutiny which Members enjoyed taking part in.

The Group noted that a number of reports had been through Scrutiny before being considered by the Executive and agreed that the process had helped to promote open and honest discussions which informed the decisions of the Executive in a much more timely manner.

The Group were disappointed that members of the local press did not attend Scrutiny meetings or publish outcomes or debates from the meetings. They agreed that Scrutiny should use the Council's press officer to promote the work of Scrutiny.

AGREED – 1) That training be arranged for new Members of Scrutiny in collaboration with other authorities where possible.

2) That discussions take place with the Council's press officer to consider how best to promote the work of Scrutiny.

### **22/12 ANY OTHER BUSINESS**

It was confirmed that a Budget Scrutiny workshop had not been arranged for this budget cycle due to the Executive releasing their savings proposals earlier. The proposals were considered by each Panel before the full budget would come through Scrutiny.

### **23/12 DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

AGREED – That the next meeting of the Scrutiny Chairs Group will take place on 1 February 2013 at 10.00am

(The meeting ended at 10.30am)

# ENVIRONMENT AND ECONOMY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL WORK PROGRAMME 2012/13

Date last revised: 19 November 2012



Issue	Type of Scrutiny					Comments/status	Meeting Dates							
	Performance Management	Key decision Item/Referred from Executive	Policy Review/Development	Scrutiny of Partnership/External Agency	Monitoring		21 Jun 12	02 Aug 12	13 Sep 12	25 Oct 12	29 Nov 12	17 Jan 13	28 Feb 13	11 Apr 13
<b>THIS MEETING 29<sup>th</sup> November 2012</b>														
<b>Economic Potential of Carlisle</b> Jane Meek/Cllr Glover				✓		To consider draft Economic Potential of Carlisle report from Carlisle Economic Partnership					✓			
<b>Budget</b> Peter Mason/Darren Crossley/All Portfolio Holders		✓	✓			To consider budget proposals for 2013/14					✓			
<b>Performance Monitoring Reports</b> Steven O'Keefe	✓				✓	Monitoring of performance relevant to the remit of Panel	✓		✓		✓		✓	
<b>Botchergate Conservation Area Appraisal</b> Jane Meek/Cllr Glover						To receive action plan once Council agree revised Conservation Area	✓				✓		✓	
<b>TASK AND FINISH GROUPS</b>														
<b>Members Small Scale Projects</b>		✓				Cllrs Bowman/Bainbridge				✓				

# ENVIRONMENT AND ECONOMY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL WORK PROGRAMME 2012/13

Date last revised: 19 November 2012

Issue	Type of Scrutiny					Comments/status	Meeting Dates										
	Performance Management	Key decision Item/Referred from Executive	Policy Review/Development	Scrutiny of Partnership/External Agency	Monitoring		21 Jun 12	02 Aug 12	13 Sep 12	25 Oct 12	29 Nov 12	17 Jan 13	28 Feb 13	11 Apr 13			
Portfolio Holder & Lead officer																	
How will T.I.C look in the future?			✓			To scope review - Cllrs Nedved/Bainbridge/Franklin/Bowditch		✓			✓						
Enterprise Centre			✓			To receive update on position of the Enterprise Centre		✓									
<b>FUTURE MEETINGS</b>																	
Carlisle Plan		✓				To consider draft Plan								?			
Waste Services Cllr Martlew/Angela Culleton			✓	✓	✓	Current position of Strategic Waste Partnership projects and Governance review Annual update - June 13	✓							✓			
Local Plan Cllr Glover/Jane Meek		✓	✓			To consider report detailing the Preferred Options prior to public consultation								✓			
Use of Green Infrastructure			✓											✓			

# ENVIRONMENT AND ECONOMY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL WORK PROGRAMME 2012/13

Date last revised: 19 November 2012

Issue	Type of Scrutiny					Comments/status	Meeting Dates							
	Performance Management	Key decision Item/Referred from Executive	Policy Review/Development	Scrutiny of Partnership/External Agency	Monitoring		21 Jun 12	02 Aug 12	13 Sep 12	25 Oct 12	29 Nov 12	17 Jan 13	28 Feb 13	11 Apr 13
Portfolio Holder & Lead officer														
<b>Environmental Performance of the Council</b> Arup Majhi/Cllr Tickner			✓		✓	Annual Monitoring of performance.					✓			
<b>Scrutiny Annual Report</b>			✓		✓	Draft report for comment before Chairs Group								✓
<b>COMPLETED ITEMS</b>														
<b>Business Improvement District</b> Darren Crossley/Cllr Glover				✓		Update on ballot outcome and next steps		✓		✓				
<b>Executive Savings Proposals</b>		✓				To consider savings proposals within the remit of the Panel				✓				
<b>Cleaning Up Carlisle</b> Angela Culleton/Cllr Martlew						To receive update report detailing Cleaning up Carlisle project and the Local Environment Enforcement Policy		✓		✓				

# ENVIRONMENT AND ECONOMY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL WORK PROGRAMME 2012/13

Date last revised: 19 November 2012



Issue	Type of Scrutiny					Comments/status	Meeting Dates							
	Performance Management	Key decision Item/Referred from Executive	Policy Review/Development	Scrutiny of Partnership/External Agency	Monitoring		21 Jun 12	02 Aug 12	13 Sep 12	25 Oct 12	29 Nov 12	17 Jan 13	28 Feb 13	11 Apr 13
<b>Portfolio Holder &amp; Lead officer</b> Angela Culleton/Keith Poole/Cllr Martlew														
<b>Car Parking</b> Angela Culleton/Keith Poole/Cllr Martlew			✓			To receive update of Car Park use and income following implementation of changes				✓				
<b>Higher Level Stewardship Grant Offer</b> Angela Culleton/Cllr Martlew		✓				To give comments to Executive on proposal of grant funding				✓				
<b>Claimed Rights</b> Angela Culleton/Cllr Martlew		✓				To scrutinise the report which considers whether to keep Highways Claimed Rights			✓					
<b>Events Policy</b>						To consider new Policy	✓							