SCHEDULE A: Applications with Recommendation

13/0048

Date of Committee: 19/04/2013

Appn Ref No: 13/0048	Applicant: Story Homes	Parish: Burgh-by-Sands
Date of Receipt: 21/01/2013 13:02:38	Agent: Positive Planning Solutions Ltd	Ward: Burgh
Location: Buck Bottom Farm, Burgh by Sands, CA5 6AN		
Proposal: Erection Of 3No. Dwellings, Conversion Of Barn To 1No. Dwelling And		

Proposal: Erection Of 3No. Dwellings, Conversion Of Barn To 1No. Dwelling And Demolition Of Outbuilding (LBC) (Revised Application)

REPORT

Case Officer: Stephen Daniel

1. Recommendation

1.1 It is recommended that this application is approved with conditions.

2. Main Issues

2.1 Impact On The Listed Buildings

3. Application Details

The Site

- 3.1 The site currently contains a number of farm buildings, some of which are listed by virtue of being within the curtilage of the adjacent Grade II Listed Buck Bottom Farmhouse.
- 3.2 A large two-storey brick barn, under a slate roof (Building 3) lies in the north-east corner of the site, in close proximity to the adjacent road. This barn forms the northern most building in a line of three buildings that run along the eastern boundary of the site. The north elevation of this building is a solid brick gable, with a hipped roof, with the southern end of the roof forming a gable. The front elevation, which faces Buck Bottom Farmhouse,

contains two windows, a door and a pitching door at first floor level.

- 3.3 A small, single-storey brick barn, with a slate roof (Building 5) is attached to the southern end of Building 3. A large two-storey barn (Building 8), which is constructed of a combination of brick and random rubble, under a concrete tiled roof, adjoins the southern end of Building 5. This building is in a poor state of repair, with sections having been re-built in new brickwork. A lean-to, which has a corrugated sheet roof, has been added to the west elevation.
- 3.4 A single-storey open fronted barn (Building 6), which is largely constructed of steel sheeting, lies to the rear of the outbuildings at Buck Bottom Farm. A single-storey cattle shed (Building 7), which is also largely constructed of corrugated steel sheeting, is attached to the south of Building 6.
- 3.5 An open fronted barn (Building 9) is located towards the southern end of the site. This building is constructed of concrete block walls (at low level), with timber posts clad with corrugated sheeting, under a corrugated sheet roof. This building was adjoined to the west by a similar sized building, constructed of similar materials (Building 10) but this has been demolished.
- 3.6 The Grade II Listed Buck Bottom Farm House is adjoined by the application site to three sides and fronts onto the main road through Burgh. The dwelling is a two-storey property, which is finished in rough render, under a slate roof. A single-storey former barn, which is attached to the western side of the farmhouse, has been incorporated into the dwelling.
- 3.7 A single-storey outbuilding, which is constructed of random rubble masonry under a corrugated sheet roof, is located to the south of the farmhouse. This building is attached to Building 6, which lies within the application site.
- 3.8 A structural survey of the existing buildings has been undertaken and this has been submitted with the application. This recommends that Building 8 should be taken down, as it is structurally unsound and beyond economic repair. The southern end of Building 5 is supported by the northern gable of Building 8 and it is, therefore, recommended that Building 5 is also taken down. In addition, buildings 6, 7 & 9, whilst not structurally unsafe, are dilapidated sheds of no importance or potential use and should, therefore, be taken down.
- 3.9 There are two existing accesses to the site, one to the east of Buck Bottom Farmhouse and one to the west.
- 3.10 Cross Farm adjoins the site to the east. This property, which is listed, contains a farmhouse and a series of outbuildings, including a cruck barn. The property has a large rear garden which contains a number of trees that lie on the boundary with the application site. Housesteads, a large detached property which sits within a large plot, lies to the west of the application site. The main road through Burgh runs to the north of the site, with residential properties lying on the opposite side of the road to the application site. Open

fields adjoin the site to the rear (south).

3.11 The site lies within the Burgh-by-Sands Conservation Area, the Solway Coast Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONB) and the Hadrian's Wall World Heritage Site Buffer Zone. In addition, the site lies immediately to the north of The Vallum and close to the site of Burgh-by-Sands Roman Fort.

Background

- 3.12 In October 2007, Conservation Area Consent was granted for the demolition of brick built & tin barns prior to site redevelopment (07/0802).
- 3.13 There have been a number of applications to redevelop the site for housing, with the number of units proposed ranging from four to nine (including one barn conversion) but all of these have been withdrawn prior to determination.

The Proposal

- 3.14 The proposal is seeking Listed Building Consent for the conversion of the two-storey barn at the front of the site to a dwelling and for the demolition of the two brick barns which are attached to this barn.
- 3.15 The two-storey Listed barn (Building 3) would be converted into a dwelling, with the attached barns (Buildings 5 & 8) being demolished. The existing openings in the front (west) elevation would be re-used to create three windows and patio doors. Three new windows would be added to the north elevation, which faces the road, one at ground floor level and two at first floor. A door and a window at first floor level would also be added to the south elevation, which would be adjoined by a car port. The car port would be built off the existing rear wall of the existing barn (Building 5) that is to be demolished. Three rooflights would also be added to the east facing roofslope. The dwelling would contain an open plan kitchen/ dining area, a lounge, a w.c. and a hall to the ground floor and four bedrooms (two en-suite) and a bathroom to the first floor. A 1.8m high stone wall would be erected to the front of the building to create a private garden space and this would include a patio area adjacent to the dwelling.

4. Summary of Representations

4.1 This application has been advertised by means of site and press notices as well as notification letters sent to fifteen neighbouring properties. One letter of objection has been received and the issues raised are summarised in the report on the planning application (13/0047).

5. Summary of Consultation Responses

Burgh-by-Sands Parish Council: - unhappy about the mixed drainage/ foul water plan and the impact on the current system. The figures presented for peak flow remain incredible. A survey of the mixed sewerage pipework infrastructure capacity in this part of Burgh should be undertaken before

development. The disposal of surface water from the site is into a private water system which then discharges into natural systems, which are already overloaded. The addition of these houses discharging into an already overloaded foul system will have an unpleasant effect on other dwellings; English Heritage - North West Region: - no comments;

Solway Coast AONB Unit: - comments awaited;

Natural England - relating to protected species, biodiversity & landscape: - no objections, subject to conditions;

Conservation Area Advisory Committee: - some concern was raised over the three new windows in the road elevation of the converted barn Plot 1. Can this quantity be reduced, perhaps by additional rooflight to bedroom 3?; excessive windows to front elevation; concern over 'domestication' of barn through proposed fenestration - can hayloft window be modified to be a plain opening rather than a domestic style sash opening?; strongly suggest retention of existing ground floor door opening to barn rather than widening; incorrect elevation compared to floorplans on barn conversion – upper floor windows are omitted on plan; lack of clarity over boundary treatments e.g. rendered wall legend on proposed site plan is ascribed to stone wall to Plot 1; quoins to plots 3 and 4 are very undersized - suggest increasing dimensions by at least 50% to reflect traditional building proportions. Recommendation – suggest that the proposal should be recommended for approval subject to modification of the above.

6. Officer's Report

Assessment

- 6.1 The relevant planning policies against which the application is required to be assessed are Policies LE9, LE12, LE13, LE14 and LE15 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016. The proposals raise the following planning issues:
 - 1. Impact On Listed Buildings
- 6.2 The brick barns within the application site are listed as curtilage buildings to the adjacent Buck Bottom Farmhouse. The two-storey brick barn would be retained and converted into a dwelling. The main changes would involve the insertion of three new windows in the roadside elevation; a new door and window in the south elevation; and the insertion of three rooflights in the east facing roofslope. The Conservation Area Advisory Committee has raised concerns about the insertion of three new windows have, however, been agreed with the Council's Heritage Officer following a site meeting and have resulted in the removal of two new windows at first floor level in the front elevation of the building.
- 6.3 The other two brick barns on the site would be largely demolished, with only part of the rear wall being retained. A structural survey has been submitted which recommends that these buildings should be taken down as they are structurally unsound and beyond economic repair. In 2007, Conservation Area Consent was granted for the demolition of all of the barns on the site,

including the two brick barns. The Council's Heritage Officer has no objections to the demolition of these barns. A new application for Conservation Area Consent for the demolition of the barns has also been submitted (13/0046).

Conclusion

6.4 In overall terms, the proposal to convert the listed two-storey barn to a dwelling and demolish the two attached brick barns would be acceptable. In all aspects, the proposals are considered to be compliant with the objectives of the relevant adopted Local Plan policies.

7. Planning History

- 7.1 In October 2007, Conservation Area Consent was granted for the demolition of brick built & tin barns prior to site redevelopment (07/0802).
- 7.2 A number of applications for the conversion of one on the barns to a dwelling and for the erection of three or eight new dwellings on the site have been withdrawn prior to determination.

8. Recommendation: Grant Permission

1. The works shall be begun not later than the expiration of 3 years beginning with the date of the grant of this consent.

Reason: In accordance with the provisions of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

- 2. The approved documents for this Listed Building Consent application comprise:
 - 1. the submitted planning application form received 21st January 2013;
 - 2. the Location Plan (drawing number BBFS-LP) received 21st January 2013;
 - 3. the Area of Excavation plan received 22nd March 2013;
 - 4. the Report on Structural Inspection received 21st January 2013;
 - 5. the Archaeological Evaluation Report received 21st January 2013;
 - 6. the Level 1 Standing Building Survey received 21st January 2013;
 - 7. the Design and Access Statement received 21st January 2013;
 - 8. the Proposed Site Plan (drawing number BBFS-PSP Rev G) received 22nd March 2013;
 - 9. the Tree Constraints Plan (drawing number BBFS-TCP Rev C) received 22nd March 2013;
 - 10. the Drainage Layout (drawing number 101P3) received 22nd March 2013;
 - 11. Plot 1 plans (drawing numbers PL1-EXPLE; PL1-EXPLP; PL1-PLE1 Rev C; PL1-PLP1 Rev A) received 22nd March 2013;
 - 12. Plot 2 plans (drawing numbers PL2-PLE1 Rev B; PL2-PLP Rev A)

received 21st January 2013;

- 13. Plot 3 plans (drawing numbers PL3-PLE1 Rev B; PL3-PLP1 Rev A) received 22nd March 2013;
- 14. Plot 4 plans (drawing numbers PL4-PLE1 Rev B; PL4-PLP1 Rev A) received 22nd March 2013;
- 15. the Barn Owl Survey received 21st January 2013;
- 16. the Drainage Strategy Statement received 21st January 2013;
- 17. the Bat Survey (Background and Supporting Information) received 21st January 2013;
- 18. the Bat Survey (Delivery Information) received 21st January 2013;
- 19. the Tree Survey plans (drawing number TS/01 sheet 1 of 3) received 21st January 2013;
- 20. the Tree Survey plans (drawing number TS/02 sheet 2 of 3) received 21st January 2013;
- 21. the Tree Survey plans (drawing number TS/03 sheet 3 of 3) received 21st January 2013;
- 22. the Tree Survey received 21st January 2013;
- 23. the Schedule of Trees received 21st January 2013;
- 24. the Notice of Decision; and
- 25. any such variation as may subsequently be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: To define the permission.

- 3. The materials (and finishes) to be used in the construction of the proposed development shall be in accordance with the details contained in the submitted application, unless otherwise agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
 - **Reason:** To ensure the objectives of Policy LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016 are met and to ensure a satisfactory external appearance for the completed development.
- 4. No development shall take place until full details of hard and soft landscape works, including a phased programme of works, have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority and these works shall be carried out as approved prior to the occupation of any part of the development or in accordance with the programme agreed by the Local Planning Authority. Any trees or other plants which die or are removed within the first five years following the implementation of the landscaping scheme shall be replaced during the next planting season.
 - **Reason:** To ensure that a satisfactory landscaping scheme is prepared and to ensure compliance with Policy CP5 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.
- 5. No development shall commence until details of any walls, gates, fences and other means of permanent enclosure and/or boundary treatment to be erected have been submitted to and approved, in writing, by the Local Planning Authority.

- **Reason:** To ensure the design and materials to be used are appropriate and to ensure compliance with Policy CP5 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.
- 6. Prior to the carrying out of any construction works the existing building affected by the proposed development shall be recorded in accordance with a Level 2 survey as described by English Heritage's document Understanding Historic Buildings A Guide to Good Recording Practice, 2006. Within 2 months of the commencement of construction works 3 copies of the resultant level 2 survey report shall be furnished to the Local Planning Authority.
 - **Reason:** To ensure that a permanent record is made of the building of architectural and historic interest prior to its alteration as part of the proposed development.
- 7. Prior to the commencement of development, details of the proposed rainwater goods and their means of fixing to the proposed dwelling shall be agreed in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The rainwater goods shall then be installed in accordance with these details.
 - **Reason:** To ensure the objectives of Policy LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016 are met and to ensure a satisfactory external appearance for the completed development.
- 8. Prior to the commencement of development, details of the proposed first floor window in the front elevation of Plot 1 shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The window shall then be installed in accordance with these details.
 - **Reason:** To ensure the design and materials to be used are appropriate and to ensure compliance with Policy LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.