CARLISLE CITY COUNCIL

www.carlisle.gov.uk

REPORT TO EXECUTIVE

PORTFOLIO AREA: ENVIRONMENT & HOUSING

Date of Meeting: **16th January 2012**

Public

Key Decision: **No** **Recorded in Forward Plan:** **No**

Inside Policy Framework

Title: **CUMBRIA COUNTY COUNCIL'S PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE HOUSEHOLD WASTE RECYCLING CENTRES**

Report of: **The Director of Local Environment**

Report reference: **LE04/12**

Summary:

Cumbria County Council is asking the public for its views on proposals to reform the way it provides Household Waste Recycling Centres (HWRCs) in the county. The proposed changes would see the county's six least used and least efficient HWRCs close and be replaced by a mobile service.

The county council is making the following proposals;

- To close six HWRC's. The six sites identified by the review as most suitable for closure (Ambleside, **Brampton**, Grange, Kirkby Stephen, Millom and Wigton) account for 15% of the total tonnage of waste handled at all of Cumbria's HWRCs and have the smallest number of visitors.
- To change the opening hours of the remaining HWRCs so they are open at the times when people use them most and reflect seasonal usage which would reduce the number of days remaining sites are open from **seven** a week to **five,** the HWRCs would **stay open at weekends** when they are used most.
- To introduce a charge for waste classed as 'non-household waste', which local authorities are not legally obliged to accept at HWRCs and includes soil, rubble, asbestos, plasterboard and car tyres.

The consultation runs from **January 9th to February 19th 2012.**

Note: in compliance with section 100d of the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 the report has been prepared in part from the following papers: None

Recommendations: - It is recommended to respond to the consultation and highlight the impact of the closure of the Brampton site such as the potential increase in fly-tipping as the result of the changes and the impact on the environment and the cost of dealing with the fly-tipping.

It is recommended that the consultation includes a request that the County consider other options to closure to reduce the cost of the site at Brampton such as reducing opening times, staffing, or to seek other ways to keep the HWDC open such as partnerships or increasing community involvement and to promote use of the site to increase its productivity during the reduced opening hours.

Request whether the County Council will provide any financial support to the City Council should there be an increase in fly tipping.

Contact Officer: Angela Culleton **Ext:** 7325

1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION AND OPTIONS

Please see the County Council consultation document attached.

2. CONSULTATION

2.1 Consultation to Date
None

2.2 Consultation proposed
It is proposed to take this as a late item to Economy and Environment Overview and Scrutiny Committee on 19th January 2012.

3. RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended to respond to the consultation and highlight the impact of the closure of the Brampton site such as the potential increase in fly-tipping as the result of the changes and the impact on the environment and the cost of dealing with the fly-tipping.

It is recommended that the consultation includes a request that the County consider other options to closure to reduce the cost of the site at Brampton such as reducing opening times, staffing, or to seek other ways to keep the HWDC open such as partnerships or increasing community involvement and to promote use of the site to increase its productivity during the reduced opening hours.

Request whether the County Council will provide any financial support to the City Council should there be an increase in fly tipping.

4. REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATIONS

It is considered that the proposals are contrary to a sustainable environment and could see a reduction in recycling and an increase in fly-tipping. The closure of the HWDC sites could result in potential additional costs to Carlisle City Council from increased fly-tipping.

5. IMPLICATIONS

- Staffing/Resources – No direct staffing implications but should the result of the proposed closures may indirectly impact on staff if either fly-tipping increases or kerbside recycling significantly increases.

- Financial – There are no financial implications arising from this report with the exception of staff time involved in preparing the consultation response. Any additional fly tipping costs, which could potentially be incurred if the site at Brampton is closed, will have to be met from within existing base budgets, pending further discussions with the County Council regarding a financial recompense.

- Legal – There are no legal comments at present as the Report deals with a proposed response to consultation.

- Corporate –

- Risk Management –

- Environmental – There is the potential for an increase in fly tipping, reduction in recycling and increase in travel from rural communities to use the next nearest HWDC.

- Crime and Disorder – There is the potential for an increase in fly tipping

- Impact on Customers – The closure of the Brampton site is a reduction in service provision in the rural community of Brampton

- Equality and Diversity –

Impact assessments

Does the change have an impact on the following?

Equality Impact Screening	**Impact Yes/No?**	**Is the impact positive or negative?**
Does the policy/service impact on the following?		
Age	No	
Disability	Yes	Negative
Race	No	
Gender/ Transgender	No	
Sexual Orientation	No	
Religion or belief	No	
Human Rights	No	
Health inequalities	No	
Rurality	Yes	Negative

If you consider there is either no impact or no negative impact, please give reasons:

.....
.....
.....

If an equality Impact is necessary, please contact the P&P team.

Cumbria County Council

Public consultation on proposals for changes to Cumbria's household waste recycling centres

Have your say
This consultation runs from 9 January 2012 until 19 February 2012.

Have your say! Public consultation on proposals for changes to Cumbria's household waste recycling centres

Consultation in a nutshell

The council is dealing with the most significant ever reductions to its budget. We have to find ways to save money. Last year we confirmed our priorities for the future were about tackling poverty, supporting vulnerable people and improving the chances in life of the most disadvantaged. That has focussed our minds on where we should look to find savings.

That's why we have reviewed our provision of household waste recycling centres. Our review has shown that our current provision, although very well run, is expensive and significant savings could be made that would bring us into line with other parts of the country.

We are proposing to:

- **Close six of the county's least used household waste recycling centres (HWRCs) in 2012**
- **Move to seasonal opening hours**
- **Close sites on the least used days of Thursday and Friday**
- **Introduce a mobile household waste recycling service to offset the impact of closures**
- **Introduce charges for disposal of soil, rubble, asbestos, plasterboard and car tyres**

We are already committed to investing in a new state-of-the-art HWRC in Lillyhall as part of West Cumbria HWRC improvement programme. This will involve the closures of Frizington and Workington HWRCs when the new site is operational in 2013

We want to hear your views on these proposals, there is more detail in the rest of this document. Your feedback will be collated and presented to the council's Cabinet in **March 2012.** Cabinet will make the final decisions on whether to proceed with, amend, or withdraw any or all of the proposals included in this document. This report will be publicly available and include responses from the council to issues that emerge through the consultation.

How to respond to this consultation:

- Complete the questions in this consultation document and post it back or fill it in online at **cumbria.gov.uk**
- Provide feedback in writing: **HWRC consultation, Freepost NWW6059A, The Courts, Carlisle, CA3 8BR**
- Email your feedback to **yoursay@cumbria.gov.uk**
- Follow us at **twitter@cumbriacc**

For those who want more information:

Follow the links from **cumbria.gov.uk** to get further background detail.

Have your say
This consultation runs from 9 January 2012 until 19 February 2012.

Why we are proposing changes

This year the council continues to be faced by significant reductions to the funding it receives from central government, which along with your council tax, pays for the services we provide. Following very large reductions last year, the reduction in 2012/13 is smaller. But we already know that the reductions will increase again in 2013/14 and 2014/15. These reductions are forcing the council to find ways to save money and reduce costs.

Last year we consulted with the public about what our priorities should be over the next several years. After considering your feedback we decided that our priorities should be about tackling poverty, supporting vulnerable people and improving the chances in life of the most disadvantaged. That has really focussed our minds on where we should look to find savings.

That's why in last year's budget we decided to review our waste services with the aim of making significant savings of around £4m per year from the £29m we spend on waste services. We have now completed a review of our household waste recycling centres. It has shown that our current provision is expensive and that changes could be made that would contribute around £2m to this target. These changes would also bring us into line with other parts of the country.

We think this is the right thing to do, when budgets are being squeezed ever harder we think we should be prioritising the money we spend on people, not rubbish.

What our review found

We looked at a range of different information as part of our review. Our analysis is that the way we currently do things is expensive and that changes to the service can be made that will deliver significant savings while still meeting the needs of the public, maximising recycling and ensuring sites meet the highest standards.

Public behaviour has changed

Overall how the public deal with waste has changed dramatically in recent years. Through successful public awareness campaigns and infrastructure improvements the total amount of waste we produce in Cumbria has been reduced by 25% and recycling has increased from 29% to 46% since 2005. District councils also provide a very high standard of kerbside collection services. With a greater range of waste now being collected at the kerbside, the need for people to visit one of our HWRCs has been noticeably reduced.

Our HWRC network is inefficient

We've looked closely at how HWRC sites are actually used by the public. We have concluded the following.

- Most sites are open from 08.00 to 18.00 seven days a week but 97% of visits take place between 08.00 to 16.00 and 91% take place between 09.00 to 16.00. In other words 25% of the opening hours account for just 9% of the use.
- In general, Thursdays and Fridays are the quietest days and weekends are busiest.
- There is seasonal variation in how sites are used, with less use between October and February.
- We operate 14 HWRC sites, but the seven least used account for just 25% of visits and 21% of the total waste collected.
- Sites vary in performance, usage and waste collected, this impacts on comparative levels of cost across the network. For example it costs the council £1.33 per visit for Carlisle compared to £6.24 per visit for Brampton.

We have too many HWRC sites

There is currently an overprovision of HWRCs compared to other rural authorities. Some similar sized or larger authorities have fewer sites. In the case of Cheshire their population is 40% larger than Cumbria's but they only have seven sites. You can see more comparisons in the table below.

How do we compare?

Local Authority	Number of HWRC	Population	HWRC per 100,000 population
Durham	15*	493,500	3.04
Cumbria	14	495,200	2.83
Devon	20	749,900	2.67
Cornwall	12	535,300	2.24
Norfolk	19	862,300	2.2
Cheshire	7	700,000	1
Lancashire	15*	1,400,000	1

* Currently consulting on site closures

We spend more than other councils on these services

A government value for money analysis in 2009/10 showed that we have an expensive "environmental spend per head" compared to other rural councils. We spend £56.05 per person and the average spend is £40.36 per person. There are three main reasons for this:

- We are a large rural authority
- We have a high volume of green waste because we have a lot of gardens
- We have a higher number of HWRCs compared to other rural councils

We can't do much about the first two but we could make changes to our HWRC provision that would reduce our "environmental spend per head".

Our non-household waste disposal policy is expensive

Cumbria currently provides facilities to dispose of waste not legally defined as household waste (asbestos, gypsum, construction waste and tyres). Most other councils charge for this service but we currently do not. This costs the council over £200,000 every year.

People use HWRCs relatively infrequently

In November 2011 we surveyed the 3000 members of our Citizens' Panel and asked them about how they used HWRCs. We found the majority, 60%, used them less than once a month, 20% never used them and 20% were more frequent users. We also found that most people, 78%, said that they tended to use other services to get rid of bulky household items – either using the district council bulky waste collection service or passing items on to charities.

Fly-tipping is a minor issue

Evidence from other councils who have made similar changes to those we are proposing shows that there has not been an increase in fly-tipping as a result.

Mobile Services

Evidence from other councils shows a mobile service could be introduced which could improve access across the county, especially in rural areas.

Our proposals in detail

We are proposing a range of changes to our service. Below we provide more detail about each of the proposals and ask for your views.

Proposal 1

Reducing the number of household waste recycling centres

There are currently 14 household waste recycling centres in operation. Our proposal is to reduce this to seven and introduce a mobile HWRC service. The new mobile service would visit areas up to four times a year to offset impact of closures (see proposal 2).

We looked closely at all of our current HWRCs and developed a set of objective criteria to identify the least viable sites. That included consideration of:

- Cost per visit to the council
- Amount of waste disposed of at the site
- Number of visits affected through closure

The results of this assessment show that six sites emerge as being comparatively less viable to operate than the rest.

These are Ambleside, Brampton, Grange, Millom, Wigton and Kirkby Stephen. Our proposal is to close these six sites.

We are already committed to investing in a new state-of-the-art HWRC in Lillyhall as part of West Cumbria HWRC improvement programme. This will involve the closures of Frizington and Workington HWRCs. These two sites suffer from traffic congestion which hinders access to neighbouring businesses and is potentially hazardous. Furthermore, the range of recycling facilities that can be provided at these sites is restricted by the limited space available. The Frizington and Workington HWRCs sites will not close until the new site becomes operational. This will leave a provision of 7 sites by 2013.

Current sites	Proposed sites

Your views on Proposal 1

1. Which HWRCs do you currently use?

- ☐ Carlisle
- ☐ Brampton
- ☐ Wigton
- ☐ Maryport
- ☐ Frizington
- ☐ Millom
- ☐ Barrow
- ☐ Ulverston
- ☐ Ambleside
- ☐ Kendal
- ☐ Kirkby Stephen
- ☐
- ☐ Workington
- ☐ Grange-over-sands
- ☐ Flusco

2. Approximately how often do you visit a HWRC?

- ☐ Weekly
- ☐ Yearly
- ☐ Fortnightly
- ☐ Less than once a year
- ☐ Monthly
- ☐ Never
- ☐ Once every 6 months

3. How long does it currently take you to travel to your nearest HWRC?

- ☐ 0 - 10 mins
- ☐ 10 - 20 mins
- ☐ 20 – 30 mins
- ☐ 30 + mins

4. Do you usually make a specific journey or do you combine your visit with a journey elsewhere?

- ☐ Specific journey
- ☐ Combined journey

5. Have you used any other means of disposing of household waste items in the last 12 months?

- ☐ Household refuse collection service
- ☐ Bring bank (recycling drop off point, e.g. at the supermarket
- ☐ Internet based organisations (Freecycle, Freegle, Gumtree etc)
- ☐ Bulky waste collection service
- ☐ Charity Shops

Other: _____

6. How would the proposed changes affect you?

- ☐ No change
- ☐ I will have to drive further to get to a permanent Household Waste Recycling Centre
- ☐ I will compost more at home
- ☐ I will put more rubbish out for collection
- ☐ I will recycle less
- ☐ I will use the council's bulky waste collection service more
- ☐ I will pay someone to take rubbish away, i.e. skip hire
- ☐ I will donate more items to charity organisations

7. To what extent do you agree or disagree with Proposal 1?

- ☐ Strongly agree
- ☐ Agree
- ☐ Neither/Nor
- ☐ Disagree
- ☐ Strongly disagree

8. Do you have any comments on Proposal 1?

Proposal 2

Introduce a mobile household waste recycling centre service

Other councils have introduced this type of service and it has been popular with residents. There are a wide variety of ways that it could operate. The information below is a generic description of how it could work; the specifics for Cumbria would be worked out once we've had your feedback.

Three vehicles could be used to allow disposal of three types of waste (reuse/recycling, garden waste and general waste). The vehicles would park up in HWRC closure areas (Millom, Ambleside, Grange-over-Sands, Kirkby Stephen, Wigton and Brampton) at a set time, four times a year, probably at weekends. A calendar would be provided detailing when the mobile service would visit each area. There could be a number of these mobile services set up covering the county.

In addition we could also provide a mobile service to Egremont and Seascale twice a year as there would be no permanent site in the Copeland district by 2013.

This would both offset the impact of site closures and actually increase access to an HWRC service, particularly for areas that are currently a significant distance from a permanent site.

1. Would you use a mobile service if the council went ahead with the other site closures?

☐ Yes, I would use this service when available
☐ No, I would prefer to use my next nearest permanent site

2. What time of year would you want the Mobile HWRC to visit your area?

☐ January - February ☐ March – April ☐ May - June
☐ July - August ☐ September - October ☐ November - December

3. How often would you use a Mobile HWRC service within a year?

☐ Once ☐ Twice ☐ Three times ☐ Four times ☐ Never

4. How long would you be prepared to travel to visit a Mobile HWRC?

☐ 0 - 10 mins ☐ 10 - 20 mins ☐ 20 - 30 mins ☐ 30 + mins

5. When would be your preferred days and times for a mobile service to visit your community?

Saturday		**Sunday**	
Morning 09.00 – 12.00		Morning 09.00 – 12.00	
Afternoon 12.00 – 16.00		Afternoon 12.00 – 16.00	
Evening 15.00 – 18.00		Evening 15.00 – 18.00	

6. Are there any potential sites in your area that you would suggest for the mobile recycling service?

District	**Town/Village**

7. Do you have any further comments on Proposal 2?

Proposal 3

Changing the opening hours and days

Most of our HWRCs currently open between 08.00 – 18.00 everyday throughout the year. Vehicle count data shows on average 91% of people visit between 09.00 – 16.00 and sites are least used from November through to mid March. We are proposing the following opening hours to make the network more cost effective. These changes would apply to all HWRCs from 1 April 2012.

March to September	**Open 08.00 – 18.00**
October to February	**Monday to Friday 09.00 – 16.00** **Saturday to Sunday 08.00 – 16.30**

1. Thinking about the time you normally visit, what is your view on the proposed opening times?

- ☐ I am happy with the proposed opening times
- ☐ I would prefer earlier opening times
- ☐ I would prefer later opening times
- ☐ No opinion

In general, although there are exceptions, Thursdays and Fridays are the quietest days and weekends are busier. We are proposing to close all sites on Thursdays and Fridays from 1 April 2012.

2. Thinking about the time you normally visit, what is your view on the proposed opening days?

- ☐ I am happy with the proposed opening days
- ☐ I am not happy with the proposed opening days
- ☐ No opinion

3. Do you have any further comments on Proposal 3?

Proposal 4

Introducing charging for non-household waste disposal

Only certain types of waste are legally defined as 'household waste'. The council must provide facilities to dispose of this type of waste for free. Other types of waste like soil, rubble, asbestos, plasterboard and car tyres are legally defined as 'non-household waste'. The council currently also allows disposal of these types of waste at HWRCs free of charge although there is no legal requirement to do so. This costs the council over £200,000 per year.

In line with many other councils across the country we are proposing to introduce charges for the disposal of these types of waste at HWRCs. The charges would cover the cost of providing the service.

The proposed charges are below:

Soil and Hardcore	Asbestos	Plasterboard	Car Tyres
£2.50 per rubble sack **£15.00 small van or trailer (estimated carrying capacity up to 250kg)**	**£10 per sheet or sack (sack no bigger than 50cm x 80cm)**	**£5 per sheet or sack (sack no bigger than 50cm x 80cm)**	**£2.50 each**

1. To what extent do you agree or disagree with introducing charging to cover the cost of disposal of non-household waste?

☐ Strongly agree ☐ Agree ☐ Neither/Nor ☐ Disagree ☐ Strongly disagree

2. Do you have any further comments on Proposal 4?

About you

Please complete these questions which will help us to see if there are differences between the views of different residents. All the information you give will be kept completely confidential.

1. Are you male or female?

☐ Male ☐ Female

2. What was your age on your last birthday?

☐ Years

3. Do you have any long-standing illness, disability or infirmity? (long-standing means anything that has troubled you over a period of time or that is likely to affect you over a period of time).

☐ Yes ☐ No

4. To which of these groups do you consider you belong to?

White:
- ☐ English/Welsh/Scottish/Northern Irish/British
- ☐ Irish
- ☐ Gypsy or Irish Traveller
- ☐ Any other White background

Asian/Asian British:
- ☐ Pakistani
- ☐ Bangladeshi
- ☐ Chinese
- ☐ Indian
- ☐ Any other Asian/Asian British background

Mixed/multiple ethnicity:
- ☐ White and Black Caribbean
- ☐ White and Black African
- ☐ White and Asian
- ☐ Any other Mixed/multiple ethnic background

Black/ Black British:
- ☐ African
- ☐ Caribbean
- ☐ Any other Black/Black British background
- ☐ Arab

Any other ethnic group (please write in the box)

5. Postcode

6. Is there anything else you would like to add? Please write in box below

Thank you for sharing your views on our proposals.

Please return your completed consultation document to:
HWRC consultation, Freepost NWW6059A, The Courts, Carlisle, CA3 8BR

The deadline for responses is 19 February

If you require this document in another format (eg CD, audio cassette, Braille or large type) or in another language, please telephone 01228 606060.

আপনি যদি এই তথ্য আপনার নিজের ভাষায় পেতে চান তাহলে অনুগ্রহ করে **01228 606060** নম্বরে টেলিফোন করুন।

如果您希望通过母语了解此信息，
请致电 **01228 606060**

Jeigu norėtumėte gauti šią informaciją savo kalba, skambinkite telefonu 01228 606060

W celu uzyskania informacji w Państwa języku proszę zatelefonować pod numer 01228 606060

Se quiser aceder a esta informação na sua língua, telefone para o 01228 606060

Bu bilgiyi kendi dilinizde görmek istiyorsanız lütfen 01228 606060 numaralı telefonu arayınız

CCC.J/N.15796