

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	Comments
Spatial distribution of growth	To promote a sustainable pattern of development to support the vision for managed growth (pages 15-16)	Q SDG 1 Should we set a long term direction for growth in which its delivery would exceed the lifetime of the Plan?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	4. We are setting the context for managed growth through the I & O process 5. The options extends beyond the lifetime of the Plan, by exceeding the time period of the plan growth can be better managed as we will have the context of the earlier years. Yes answer would be better but a no answer would still allow the objective to be achieved.
		Q SDG 2 What should be the future direction of growth?									
		1. Growth should be focussed within the existing built extent of the Carlisle's urban area; or	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✗	✓	May force the release of land. May put pressure on infrastructure. 7. Amend option to say 'within the urban area boundary' rather than 'built extent'.
		2. Extend the urban area to the south to allow for a significant expansion incorporating a wide range of uses including employment land to help to address the imbalance in distribution of employment sites between the north and south of the City; or	✓	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	Evidence to support the delivery of this option e.g. SHLAA Depends on the scale of expansion Sustainable urban extensions conform with national policy.
		3. Extend development to make use of the improved highway infrastructure that will be in place once the CNDR is operational; or	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	2. The option could be further clarified in the area of 'make use of the improved highway infrastructure' e.g. just a roundabout/both sides of the road etc.
		4. Distribute growth around all edges of the main urban area	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	Comments
Infrastructure	To ensure that appropriate infrastructure measures and community facilities are put in place to cope with the impact of new development. (pages 16-17)	Q 1.1. Should development be focused only in locations which would help with the provision of new highways infrastructure?	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	2. This question was formulated with the proposed southern relief road and the inner orbital route in mind. Option could be further clarified. There is a risk that Botchergate is never going to be seen as sufficiently attractive as a location for development.
		Q 1.2. Should development be spread around the city to minimise the impact on existing road infrastructure?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q 1.3. Should development be restricted in certain areas where there are existing pressures on the highway network, if so, where?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Is a further option needed needed to allow a combination of the above 3 options.
Housing aspirations	To enable the development of a range of high quality, energy efficient housing, in a variety of locations, to meet the aspirations of the existing community and those wishing to move to the area, and which will help build communities and support economic growth. (pages 18-27)	H1. With reference to an overall housing target across the whole of Carlisle District, which of the following options will help to deliver the housing objective set out at the start of this paper?									

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	7. Clarification is needed to show that housing target will be averaged out over the plan period.
		1. Continue with an annual district housing target of 450/year?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	7. Clarification is needed to show that housing target will be averaged out over the plan period.
		2. Aim for a growth led scenario envisaging an average of 600 houses/year?	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	Question whether we could achieve these build rates. Risk is difficult to define due to the current economic situation.
		3. Select a lower target which would only aim to meet the broad range of local housing needs including affordable, open market, the elderly and other special needs?	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	1. Question whether a lower target would support economic growth
		Q H2. When the overall district target is decided, should it be split?									
		1. 80% Carlisle City and 20% for the rural area?									
		2. With a higher proportion for the City?									We feel these questions lack clarity and require an actual % e.g. 70/30, 50/50. Discuss
		3. With a higher proportion for the rural area?									
		Q H3 Location of new urban housing development									
		1. Should we aim for new housing land allocations to be evenly dispersed across the city?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		2. Should new housing allocations be concentrated in a maximum of two or three different locations of a significant size on the edge of the city?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q H4 With reference to the location of rural housing development, which of the following options will benefit the rural area and its communities the best?									
		1. Continue with the current approach?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. Identify land for housing in the larger rural settlements e.g. Brampton, Longtown, Dalston, Scotby, Wetheral, and have a policy which allows housing in the remainder of the LSCs?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		3. Redefine the list of LSCs, recognising that villages often work in clusters and are interdependent on each other;	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	2. Needs further detail
		4. Include smaller villages within a two mile radius of Carlisle as suitable locations for development, provided they have good public transport, cycle and footpath connections, e.g. Linstock	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q H5 To increase the supply and range of types of affordable housing across the District should:									
		1. All housing sites be required to provide a proportion of affordable housing?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. Only sites over a certain size be required to provide affordable housing, and if so, what should the threshold be?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q H6 With Regards to local needs housing:									
		1. Should the Core Strategy make provision for new build local needs housing in the smaller villages to ensure that the needs of local people are met?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. Are the criteria set out in the above bullet points about right? Y/N	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		3. Do you think further criteria are needed? Y/N	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Carlisle Core Strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q H7. With regard to the hierarchy of settlements within the district for the purposes of preferred locations for new development:									
		1. Should we continue with the existing settlement hierarchy with the focus of development being the City of Carlisle, followed by the key service centres of Brampton, Longtown and the 20 Local Service Centres listed below;	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. Should Dalston be added to the list of key service centres to reflect the range of services and facilities that are available within the village?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		3. Should the question of whether a village is classed as a local service centre be dependent on whether it meets a specified range of services/facilities and public transport connections. For example a school, shop, post office, pub, village hall, church etc. Have you any suggestions for the level of services that would lead to a village being classified as a local service centre?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q H8 Settlement boundaries									
		1. Should settlement boundaries be kept as they are?	x	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	This question will not enable the overall housing objective to be delivered however settlement boundaries form part of the RSS.
		2. Should settlement boundaries be redefined (having regard to recent research) to allow for some growth?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		3. Should settlement boundaries be scrapped, and any proposals for new development be assessed against set criteria including settlement form, landscape character and the particular characteristics of the location?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q H9 Depending on the level of need shown, should a site for Gypsies and Travellers be identified?									
		1. In or on the edge of Carlisle?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. in a different location. If so, where?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Economy	To create opportunities for economic growth by increasing the working age population, the skills available, the diversity of the economy and the physical infrastructure to deliver it. (pages 27-32)	Q E1 The Carlisle Employment Land and M6 Corridor study identified two scenarios and these best represent the options available. Which of the scenarios is appropriate for Carlisle?									
		1. The baseline scenario forecasts a rise in total Full Time Equivalent (FTE) employment of 1,200 in Carlisle between 2009 and 2026 (50,100, rising to 51,300) – representing growth of 2.4%.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. The inspirational scenario forecasts a total increase of 4,300 FTE jobs in Carlisle over the same period (50,100, rising to 54,400) – representing higher growth of 8.6%	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	Unknownable at present - however scenario established in the Carlisle Employment Sites Study evidence base.
		Q E2 How should we treat existing employment areas and are they all the same or do we develop different areas. Which of the following should apply?									
		1. Support the retention and improvement of existing employment areas?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. Allow their redevelopment to increase investment but retain industrial classes of development? reinvestment in alternative locations?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Clarify

9

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q E6 Are there new opportunities for rural employment we should address?	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Examples of what is meant by this to improve clarity.
		Q E7 Do we continue to resist the loss of agricultural and other buildings away from rural employment uses?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q E8 The Auction Marts in Longtown and Carlisle are significant uses dependent on the agricultural economy - how do we cater for the future needs of Carlisle's auction mart and can this be met on the existing allocated site or do we open up another opportunity?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q E9 The university of Cumbria will play a vital key role in Carlisle's economy. What measures do we need to take to support its contribution?									
		Do we allow redevelopment and rationalisation of existing sites?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Where could we develop new facilities for the longer term?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Where should we locate student accommodation and how much?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q E10 Do we need specific support for certain types of development to recognise the contribution or would this be too restrictive?									Move these or include an energy sector introduction
		Given challenges of supplying energy for the plan period and beyond are there specific measures we need to take?									
		Q E11 Are there specific areas which should have strategic policies in the core strategy to encourage activity in those areas?									
		A City Centre – above national guidance do we need to ensure that the city centre remains the prime destination and encourage improvements to the City Centre.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		B Carlisle Airport - what opportunities do we need to refer to enable further growth of the airport	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Planning permission?
		C – Botchergate – how do we ensure the regeneration of Botchergate area to encourage new investment	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Could be a potential issue with viability in respect of developing Botchergate.
		D – Regional Investment Sites – strategic sites had been identified through Regional Spatial Strategy at Kingmoor Park/Brunthill and City Centre – do these need redefining?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Retail	To ensure that Carlisle fulfils its status as a centre for regional shopping providing a vibrant mix of retail opportunities to meet changing consumer demands. (Pages 32-36)	Q R1 What future strategy should we pursue for food stores?									
		No more large retail superstores until a review at 2021?	x	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	x	?	Would not contribute towards fulfilling the objective of the Plan as it would seek to restrict superstore development.
		There is still a need to strengthen the City Centre food offer and a new superstore in the City centre should be provided.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Should existing food stores be allowed to extend their current size to cater for future growth?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		For smaller food stores should we continue to allow them to develop in smaller neighbourhoods?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q R2 How should we plan for future comparison shopping?									
		Restrict comparison goods to city centre to ensure that remains the prime location for development and redevelopment existing areas to cater for greater demand, if so where?	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	Problem with the size of existing units would need to encourage the development of larger retail units to enable this to be a realistic option.
		Allow a relaxation of goods sold for non city centre retail units to increase occupancy and attract larger operators	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	x	Full impacts of this approach would have to be understood to assess whether the approach would be contrary to PPS4 and negatively impact upon the vitality and viability of the City Centre.

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	How does this fit with PPS4?
		Allow further retail park development to compete with Gretna such as the creation of a new modern retail park	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	?	✓	?	
		Q R3 How do we ensure that the City Centre Retail experience will remain a lead retail destination in the future?									
		Ensure that the historic character of the city centre is retained to provide a mix of units for all retailers.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Potential issue with the size of available units and whether developing larger units to accommodate a larger range of retailers might affect the character of the city centre, this approach may be too restrictive.
		Allow further development in the city centre to attract larger operators	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Concentrate development of retail in certain areas around the city centre to improve the city centre offer	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	?	✓	✓	Clarify what is meant by this.
		Limit the out of town retail opportunities to restrict local competition with the city centre	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	Potential issue with expansion of the retail offer. Needs to be applied alongside identification of City Centre development opportunities or there may be the risk that it will not be flexible enough to allow for retail expansion.
		Q R4 To ensure that the rural area is provided with retail facilities to cater for local needs should we:									
		Continue to support retention of rural facilities in all centres?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Or just in major centres such as Brampton, Longtown and Dalston?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Are there other options which will encourage new facilities to be provided?									What is meant by this, provide examples?

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Tourism, Heritage, Culture and Leisure	To encourage and support tourism and cultural proposals for conserving, enhancing and promoting Carlisle's heritage and opportunities provided by the natural landscape to generate maximum social and economic benefit whilst ensuring that proposals are sympathetic to the elements that make Carlisle and Cumbria special. (pages 37-40)	Q THC 1 Is it appropriate and necessary for the core strategy to promote the development of tourism opportunities throughout the District or should this be included in a subsequent development plan document?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q THC2 Hotel Accommodation									
		1. Should the core strategy identify a strategic site for the development of a 4/5* hotel?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	How likely is it that delivery partners will be found, potential sites can be identified but will need private sector commitment.
		2. If so, where should the hotel be located?									
		a. in the city centre, or	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Firmer evidence required to support need for a 4/5* hotel.
		b. in Brampton, Longtown, Dalston, or	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	?	✓	Location may make the option unlikely

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	Location may make this option unlikely – narrower market – REMOVE OPTION
		e. in a local service centre	✓	✓	✗	✓	?	?	?	✓	
		d. or in a location related to another established enterprise – e.g. employment site, tourism facilities, sport/leisure facility.	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		Q THC3 Supporting the development of the cultural/leisure offer									
		1. Should the core strategy identify an area of the city for the development of a 'cultural/leisure quarter'	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
		2. Should the core strategy identify a strategic site for a single large scale leisure development?	✓	✓	✓	?	✓	✓	✓	✓	4. Some uncertainty over potential delivery partners e.g. University?
		Q THC4 Managing our heritage assets									
		1. Should the core strategy adopt a positive approach whereby heritage has the opportunity to be key to is central to regeneration opportunities? Such as Botchergate	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Heritage is recognised as one of the drivers for regeneration
		2. Should the core strategy give no additional special status to heritage over and above that required by legislation and Government guidance?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		3. Should the Core strategy give priority to the achievement of other objectives over and above the preservation and enhancement of architectural and heritage assets?	x	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	?	Delete this option, unnecessary
Local Character	To protect the quality of the District's landscape and townscape in terms of its distinctive local character, and to explore opportunities for enhancement. (pages 40-41)	Q LC1 to maintain and enhance the District's distinctive local character, should new development 1. Aim for standard densities across the district 2. Be influenced by local character and densities 3. Aim for a mix of density within each site?	x	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Delete this option, wouldn't meet the objective
Health and wellbeing	Create a thriving, successful and healthy community for all. (pages 42-43)	QHW1 To promote health and wellbeing 1. Can you suggest ways that the core strategy can influence (either through policy or a specific site allocation for a health service facility) the health and wellbeing of the residents of the District?									

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8
		2. Should we have a policy to enable the planned provision and enhancement of open space, sport and recreation facilities to encourage healthy communities?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Climate change & flood risk	To reduce emissions of greenhouse gases and carbon dioxide emissions and implement adaptation to climate change. (Pages 44-47)	Q CC1a. Do you agree that development should be concentrated as much as possible in areas of the lowest flood risk potential (i.e. FZ1) and avoid FZ3?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
		Q CC1b. In the event that development must be exceptionally located in higher flood risk areas (i.e. FZs 2&3) do you agree that it must be on previously developed land and include measure to control and mitigate flood risk including design measures such as raised floor levels and measures which do not result in increased flood risk elsewhere?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
		Q CC2a. How might policies contribute to meeting the zero carbon standard at code for sustainable homes level 6 by 2016 which all new homes will have to reach?								

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q CC3a Should the core strategy set a % target (e.g. 10-20%) for on site renewable energy in all new developments?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	Viability – setting a target figure doesn't necessarily allow for other costs associated with development therefore may not be appropriate in all instances.
		Q CC3b Should the core strategy set a sliding scale of targets with larger developments being required to meet a higher %?									
		Q CC3c Should the core strategy policy on climate change have a spatial element, with a different % target for on site renewables being developed for the City and the rural area?									
		Q CC3d Should all new developments be required to demonstrate in a sustainable design statement that energy efficiency options have been considered?									Delete option – wouldn't this go into the validation checklist, not a core strategy issue.
		Q CC4 Do you agree that new development should be located in the most sustainable locations possible that decrease car dependency and have the best available access to jobs, facilities and services?	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
		Q CC5a Should on site protection and restoration of biodiversity, habitats (including woodlands and trees), character and landscape features be required by all new development to avoid loss of damage to assets?									Remove as not strategic, Green Infrastructure section expand.
		Q CC5b Would off site mitigation nearby of assets lost or damaged by development be acceptable?									
Green Infrastructure	To retain and expand the green and blue infrastructure of the District for the benefits of Carlisle's citizens and tourists. Pages (47-48)	Q CC6a GI 1 . Should all development contribute on site where possible and off site to the creation of green infrastructure resources?									Expand this section Re look at this section
		Q CC6b GI 2 . Should all urban development contribute to urban greening through planning obligations?									Explanation of what is meant by urban greening
		Q CC6d GI 3 . Have you any suggestions for new leisure provision or places where recreation provision is lacking?									
		Q- CC6e GI 4 . Have you any suggestions for areas which you think should be considered for designation or protection because of their biodiversity or nature conservation value?									

Carlisle Core strategy Options Reasonableness Test Screening Table

July 2011

Theme	Objective	Option	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Landscape	Carlisle is a District with diverse and stunning landscapes of the highest quality. We need to meet the need for development together with ensuring these landscapes are managed, conserved and enhanced for the future. (pages 48-49)	Q L1 In terms of the core strategy approach to protecting and enhancing important landscapes, which of the following options, or combinations of options do you agree with? 1. Develop a criteria based policy for landscape protection based on the Cumbria Landscape Character Guidance Toolkit; 2. To retain the Urban Fringe Landscape designation (as allowed for by PPS7 para. 25) in conjunction with option 2 1 above.									
			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	
			✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	