

## SCHEDULE A: Applications with Recommendation

14/0648

Item No: 09

Date of Committee: 03/10/2014

**Appn Ref No:**  
14/0648

**Applicant:**  
Mr & Mrs Smith

**Parish:**  
Wetheral

**Agent:**  
Johnston & Wright

**Ward:**  
Great Corby & Geltsdale

**Location:** Orchard Lodge, Great Corby, Carlisle, CA4 8NE

**Proposal:** Demolition Of Extension And Garage; Two Storey Rear Extension To Provide Additional Accommodation on Ground Floor With Garden Room And Balcony Above (LBC)

**Date of Receipt:**  
23/07/2014

**Statutory Expiry Date**  
17/09/2014

**26 Week Determination**

---

### REPORT

**Case Officer:** Suzanne Osborne

#### 1. Recommendation

- 1.1 It is recommended that this application is approved with conditions.

#### 2. Main Issues

- 2.1 Impact Of The Proposal On The Grade II Listed Building

#### 3. Application Details

##### The Site

- 3.1 Orchard Lodge is a single storey Grade II Listed property situated close to the centre of Great Corby on the eastern side of the road which leads from the crossroads in the middle of the village towards the primary school. The dwelling, formerly an entrance lodge for Corby Castle, is set back from the adjacent road and is constructed from dressed red sandstone walls under a slate roof. The property has a prominent segmental plan porch on Tuscan columns located on the south-west elevation and a modern brick extension with a felted roof (constructed in the 1970s) located on the south-east elevation. An existing detached modern brick garage is also situated at the

back of the property adjacent to the 1970s extension.

- 3.2 The typography of the application site is varied resulting in the dwelling and its garden area to the front of the site being located at a higher level to the road leading through Great Corby. The raised level extends back into the site to accommodate the dwelling and courtyard with a further raised garden area located to the south-east. The surroundings are wholly residential with 2no. two storey dwellings (Inglenook and Green Croft) located to the north-east and two storey dwellings located at "The Orchard" to the south-west. Due to the difference in levels surrounding the site the dwellings to the north-east are located at a slightly lower level to Orchard Lodge and the dwellings located to the south-west are located at a significantly higher level.
- 3.3 The property falls within Great Corby Conservation Area and there is a public footpath which runs along the track to the north-east of the site which separates Orchard Lodge from the adjacent residential properties.

### **The Proposal**

- 3.4 The proposal seeks Listed Building Consent to demolish the existing 1970's extension and modern garage and to construct a new extension on the south-west elevation of the property to accommodate 3no.bedrooms, utility, WC and bathroom on the ground floor with a garden room above in the new roof space. A balcony from the garden room is proposed with steps leading down onto the raised garden area to the rear of the site.
- 3.5 Members should be aware that the original plans submitted showed the proposed extension with a higher ridge height than the existing building with no differentiation between old and new build. The plans have since been significantly amended with the ridge height of the extension now corresponding with the existing building. The extension is now separated from the original dwelling by a glazed entrance hall and a new sandstone faced screen wall which will be formed round the new extension in the existing courtyard. The remaining part of the extension will be constructed from brick walls, vertically sliding timber windows with stone surrounds under a lakeland slate roof. The balcony is to be constructed from hardwood with glazed balustrades. A full height timber screen will however be located on the north-eastern side of the balcony to protect the living conditions of adjacent properties.
- 3.6 A number of internal alterations in the existing building are also proposed consisting of removing a previously built up doorway to form a larger opening between the living room/dining room, opening up the ceiling to the living room to its original profile, building up an existing doorway in the living room and rebuilding a fireplace.
- 3.7 It is also proposed to reslate the existing roof and repair the lead work. Existing stonework will be repaired and repointed in hydraulic lime mortar. Windows will be renewed with slim line double glazed timber sashes of traditional proportions. The existing timber floor will be repaired and

insulated. External walls will also be lined internally with insulation and finished in lime plaster to replace the previous cement plaster.

- 3.8 New painted metal railings and gates to the existing sandstone gate pillars are also proposed. The entrance courtyard and access drive is to be resurfaced with gravel and new sandstone entrance steps to the existing porch and entrance screen is proposed due to the difference in site levels.

#### **4. Summary of Representations**

- 4.1 This application has been advertised by the display of a site notice, press notice and by means of notification letters sent to 7 neighbouring properties. In response to the original plans submitted 4 letters of objections from 3 separate households have been received.
- 4.2 The letters of objection raise a number of issues which are summarised as follows:
1. Object to the use of brick and zinc cladding;
  2. Extension should be constructed from sandstone to match the existing property;
  3. Extension will be out of character with its surroundings;
  4. Size and scale of the extension in relation to the Listed Building and Conservation Area;
  5. Impact upon the living conditions of Inglenook and Green Croft in terms of overshadowing, overlooking and loss of privacy;
  6. Proposal doesn't include reference to the large conifer tree to the rear of the site;
  7. Loss of conifer tree would have a negative impact upon the Conservation Area.
- 4.3 As stated in paragraph 3.5 of this report revised plans have since been received significantly altering the design of the proposed development. No further comments have been received from third parties during the reconsultation period.

#### **5. Summary of Consultation Responses**

Georgian Group - Amenity: - raised objections to the scale and design of the original plans submitted. Revised plans have since been received and the Georgian Group although welcoming the reduction in height of the new extension still object to the proposal as they consider that the size of the extension would be damaging to the special interest and setting of the Listed

Building. The Group also consider that the new roof would have a highly damaging impact on the appearance of the western facade of the listed building with its elegant Tuscan portico. The Group therefore recommend that Listed Building Consent is refused.

Clerk to Wetheral PC, Downgate Community Centre: - Members originally raised concerns regarding the height of the extension and use of materials. Revised plans have however since been received and Members of the Parish Council have now confirmed that they are pleased to see their comments noted and approved of the revised plans submitted.

Conservation Area Advisory Committee: - originally raised concerns regarding the height and design of the proposed extension in relation to the original building. Revised plans have however since been received and the Conservation Area Advisory Committee have subsequently raised no objections.

## **6. Officer's Report**

### **Assessment**

- 6.1 The relevant planning policies against which this application is required to be assessed are Policies CP5, LE12 and LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016. The National Planning Policy Framework is also a material planning consideration. The proposals raise the following planning issues:

#### **1. Impact Upon The Grade II Listed Building**

- 6.2 Section 66 (1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservations Areas) Act 1990 states "*In considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting*".
- 6.3 The relevant planning policies seek to ensure that applications for alterations to Listed Buildings have regard to the scale, proportions, character and detailing of the existing building, and, the physical characteristics of conservation areas. Paragraph 133 of the NPPF states that Local Planning Authorities should refuse consent for any development which would lead to substantial harm to or total loss of significance of designated heritage assets.
- 6.4 Orchard Lodge is Grade II Listed, the listing details are as follows:

*"House, formerly lodge for Corby Castle. Probably 1812-17, for Henry Howard. Dressed red sandstone, slate roof with leaded hips, C20 brick chimney stack. Segmental plan porch on Tuscan columns: heavily moulded and dentilled cornice carried round sides and extension: porch has entrance to right of porch, has small sash window with single glazing bars. Entrance*

*lodge until 1844 when a new road through the grounds of the castle necessitated a new wall and entrance gates."*

- 6.5 It is not considered that the demolition of the non-original 1970s extension and modern garage would have an adverse impact upon the historic character of the existing Grade II Listed Building or the character/appearance of Great Corby Conservation Area. With regard to the proposed extension it is noted that there will be a glazed link between the existing property and the new extension as well as a sandstone faced screen wall which will be formed around the new extension. The glazed link (which will be stepped back from the building line of the existing property) and the new sandstone screen wall will allow the old and new build to be clearly distinguished. The proposed extension to the rear of the property will be set down approximately 990mm into the ground which reduces its scale and keeps the ridge height of the proposal the same as the ridge height of the existing roof. The proposed extension will be constructed from brick walls with sandstone quoin's, under a lakeland slate roof. All new windows will be constructed from timber and roof-lights will be of a Conservation Style.
- 6.6 The proposed extension has features (glazed link and a sandstone wall faced round the new extension) which clearly defines the old and new build allowing the proposed extension to be of a design sympathetic to the historic character and design of the Grade II Listed Building and the character/appearance of Great Corby Conservation Area. The balcony to the rear of the property, which will have a timber screen to the east elevation and glazed balustrades to the remaining elevations, would allow the building to reconnect to its raised garden area. Subject to the imposition of appropriate conditions requesting samples of the proposed brick to be used in the extension, a sample section of the materials for the new screen wall, all new mortar to be a cement free lime mortar, full details of all new windows/doors, sample details of the new railings and gates, samples/details of all hard surfaces together with ensuring existing slates are reused it is considered that the proposed materials of the proposed extension would complement the Grade II Listed Building.
- 6.7 Furthermore, the internal alterations to the existing building have regard to the scale, proportions and detailing of the existing doorways/openings within the building. The changes would respect the historic character of the property and would also not have an adverse impact upon its fine features.
- 6.8 Whilst the City Council's Conservation Officer, the Conservation Area Advisory Committee (CAAC) and The Georgian Group originally raised objections regarding the scale and design of the proposed extension as first submitted both the City Council's Conservation Officer and CAAC have however since raised no objections to the amended plans as currently proposed.
- 6.9 The Georgian Group although welcoming the reduction in height of the extension have still raised objections to the size of the extension stating that it would be damaging to the special interest and setting of the Listed Building. The Group also consider that the new roof would have a highly damaging impact on the appearance of the western facade of the listed building with its

elegant Tuscan portico. With regard to the objections received by The Georgian Group it is noted that the glazed link part of the extension would be set back by approximately 0.4 of a metre from the south-western elevation of the original building and the remaining part of the extension would project forward by 0.4 of a metre. The element of the extension which projects slightly further forward would however be set down into the ground by 990mm with a lower eaves height than the cornice level of the existing building. As stated in paragraph 6.6 it is considered that the old and new build is clearly defined by the glazed link, the sandstone wall and the extension being either set back or at a lower level to the existing building. Furthermore the new pitched roof replacing the previous flat roof sits behind the parapet of the original building. The roof also slopes back and away from the elegant Tuscan Porch on the south-western elevation. In such circumstances it is considered on balance that the proposal would not have an adverse impact upon the special historic features of the Grade II Listed Building.

- 6.10 Overall, subject to the imposition of conditions as outlined in paragraph 6.6, it is considered that the proposed extension/ alterations to the property would allow the building to be brought back into active residential use, providing modern living accommodation whilst respecting the fine features of the Grade II Listed Building and the character/appearance of Great Corby Conservation Area.

## **Conclusion**

- 6.11 In overall terms the proposal will not have an adverse impact upon the historic character of the Grade II Listed Building or its setting within Great Corby Conservation Area. In all aspects the proposal is considered to be compliant with the objectives of the relevant planning policies and as such the application is recommended for approval.

## **7. Planning History**

- 7.1 There is no relevant planning history on this site.

## **8. Recommendation: Grant Permission**

1. The works shall be begun not later than the expiration of 3 years beginning with the date of the grant of this consent.

**Reason:** In accordance with the provisions of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

2. The approved documents for this Listed Building Consent comprise:
1. the submitted planning application form received 23rd July 2014 (including part 8 of the application form received 18th September 2014);

2. the site location plan received the 23rd July 2014 (Drawing No.11605);
3. the site/block plan as proposed received 4th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-06B);
4. the existing floor plans, roof plan and elevations received 18th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-01A);
5. the proposed floor plans and elevations received 4th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-04F);
6. the conservation statement with design and access statement received 4th September 2014 (Revision A- September 2014);
7. the 3D sketch view 1 received 4th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-SK01);
8. the 3D sketch view 2 received 4th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-SK02);
9. the 3D sketch view of the balcony received 4th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-SK03);
10. the 3D sketch view of the rear vantage point received 10th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-SK04);
11. the 3D sketch view - front vantage point received 10th September 2014 (Drawing No.11605-SK05);
12. the Notice of Decision; and
13. any such variation as may subsequently be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

**Reason:** To define the permission.

3. Samples of the materials to be used in the construction of the external walls shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority before any work is commenced.

**Reason:** To ensure the works harmonise as closely as possible with the existing Grade II Listed Building and Great Corby Conservation Area. In accordance with Policies CP5, LE13 and LE19 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.

4. No works shall commence until such time that a sample panel of the new sandstone screen wall has been prepared and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

**Reason:** To ensure the works harmonise as closely as possible with the existing building in accordance with Policy LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.

5. All new mortar used in the pointing of the building works hereby approved shall be a cement free lime mortar, the specification of which shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority before any work is commenced.

**Reason:** To ensure the works harmonise as closely as possible with the existing building in accordance with Policy LE13 of the Carlisle

District Local Plan 2001-2016.

6. Details of all new windows and doors, in the form, of quarter or full-size drawings including sections shall be submitted for prior approval by or on behalf of the Local Planning Authority before any development takes place. Such details shall include the frames, method of glazing, means of affixing to the wall and the size and opening arrangements of the windows.

**Reason:** To ensure the works harmonise as closely as possible with the existing building in accordance with Policies CP5, LE12 and LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.

7. The existing slates shall be carefully removed, stored and subsequently re-used during the re-roofing of the property as hereby approved. Any additional stone or slate required to make up the completed roof shall be of matching quality, size, colour and appearance to the existing unless otherwise agreed in writing by the local planning authority.

**Reason:** To maintain the architectural integrity of the building and the amenities of its surroundings in accordance with Policies CP5, LE12 and LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.

8. No railings/new gates shall be installed until sample details of the railings and gates have been submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Such details should also include the method of fixing to existing pillars. The development shall then be undertaken in accordance with the approved details.

**Reason:** To ensure the works harmonise as closely as possible with the existing Grade II Listed Building and Great Corby Conservation Area in accordance with Policies CP5, LE12, LE13 and LE19 of the Carlisle District Local Plan (2001-2016).

9. Samples/full details shall be submitted of the proposed hard surface finishes to all private external areas within the proposed scheme before any site works commence. The external areas shall be constructed in accordance with the materials proposed.

**Reason:** To ensure that materials to be used are acceptable and in compliance with the objectives of Policies CP5, LE12 and LE13 of the Carlisle District Local Plan 2001-2016.

---