

COMMUNITY OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY PANEL

THURSDAY 20 JUNE 2013 AT 10.00 AM

PRESENT: Councillor Mrs Luckley (Chairman) Councillors Mrs Bradley, Ellis, Mrs Prest, Scarborough, Mrs Stevenson, Mrs Vasey and Wilson (as substitute for Councillor Miss Sherriff)

ALSO

PRESENT: Councillor Glover, Deputy Leader; and Economy and Enterprise Portfolio Holder
Councillor J Mallinson, Observer
Councillor Mrs Riddle, Observer
Councillor Bloxham, Observer

OFFICERS: Town Clerk and Chief Executive
Director of Community Engagement
Scrutiny Officer

COSP.41/13 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

An apology for absence was submitted on behalf of Councillor Miss Sherriff

COSP.42/13 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest in respect of the business to be transacted at the meeting.

COSP.43/13 REPRESENTATIVES ON OUTSIDE BODIES

The Chairman of the Community Overview and Scrutiny Panel reported that Executive Decision EX.60/13 from the Executive on 31 May 2013 concerning Representatives on Outside Bodies had been called-in by Councillors Mrs Prest, Ellis and Mrs Vasey.

The Executive had decided:

“That the City Council’s representatives on the following outside bodies be as indicated:

Outside Body	Representation
Belah Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Ellis, Morton and Mrs Vasey
Botcherby Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Betton and Scarborough; one vacancy
Brampton and Beyond Trust (previously Brampton Community Association)	Councillor Layden
Business Improvement District Board of Directors	Councillor Glover

Carlisle and District Citizens' Advice Bureau Trustee Management Committee	Councillor Earp; one vacancy
Carlisle and Eden Crime and Disorder Reduction Partnership Leadership Group	Councillor Mrs Riddle; Councillor Mrs Stevenson (as substitute)
Carlisle Educational Charity	No requirement for nominations in 2013
Carlisle Leisure Limited Board	Councillors Weber and Stothard
Carlisle Sports Council	Councillor Cape
Carlisle Tourism Partnership	Councillor Ms Quilter
Conservation Area Advisory Committee	Councillor Mrs Martlew
Cumbria Equality Champions' Group (NOTE: the primary aim of the Group is to ensure that County and District Councils collaborate on understanding Equality and make sure that elected Members have peer support in meeting the Public Sector Equality Duty)	Councillor Tickner
Cumbria Health Scrutiny Committee (NOTE: This is a joint Scrutiny Committee comprising representatives of the six District Councils in Cumbria and Cumbria County Council. The terms of reference require that Members should be full serving Members of Overview and Scrutiny Panels)	Councillor Bowditch; Councillor Watson (as substitute)
Cumbria Law Centre Management Committee	Councillor Mrs Riddle; Councillor Mrs Stevenson (as substitute)
Cumbria Leadership Board	One vacancy Councillor Glover (as substitute)
Cumbria Planning Group	Councillor Glover
Cumbria Playing Fields Association – Executive Committee	Councillor Scarborough
Cumbria Strategic Waste Partnership	Councillor Mrs Martlew; Councillor Stothard (as substitute)
Currock Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Mrs Bradley, Glover and Harid
Denton Holme Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors P Atkinson, McDevitt and Mrs Southward

The District Council's Network Assembly (NOTE: The DCN's constitution states that the representative is usually the Leader of the Council or someone in an equivalent position)	One vacancy Councillor Glover (as substitute)
Downagate Community Centre Management Committee	Councillor Graham
Friends of Tullie House Museum and Art Gallery	Councillor Mrs Martlew
Greystone Community Association	Councillor Ms Quilter
Hadrian's Wall World Heritage Site Management Plan Committee	Councillor Ms Quilter; Councillor Miss Sherriff (as substitute)
Harraby Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Forrester, Miss Sherriff and Weber
Highways and Transport Working Group	Councillor Mrs Martlew Councillor Mrs Stevenson
Local Authority World Heritage Forum	Councillor Ms Quilter; Councillor Miss Sherriff (as substitute)
Local Government Association – General Assembly	One vacancy Councillor Glover (as substitute)
Local Government Association – Rural Commission	Councillors Tickner and Ms Quilter
(NOTE: The Council is entitled to nominate two representatives, either two Members or one Member and one Officer with the first named Member being allocated the Council's vote on the Commission)	
Local Government Association – Urban Commission (NOTE: The Council is entitled to nominate two representatives, either two Members or one Member and one Officer, with the first named Member being allocated the Council's vote on the Commission)	Councillors Tickner and Ms Quilter
Local Government Information Unit	Councillor Tickner
Longtown Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Bloxham, J Mallinson and Mrs Prest
Mary Hannah Almshouses	Councillors Ellis (until March 2016), Mrs Vasey (Until March 2016) and Morton

(until June 2017)

Morton Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Bell, Mrs Stevenson and Stothard
National Association of Councillors – English Region	Councillor Mrs Riddle
National Association of Councillors	Councillor Mrs Riddle
North Pennines Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty Partnership	TBC
North West Local Authorities Employers Organisation	Councillor Glover; Councillor Tickner (as substitute)
North West Regional Housing Forum	Councillor Mrs Riddle
PATROL (Parking and Traffic Regulations Outside London) Adjudication Joint Committee)	Councillor Mrs Martlew; Councillor Bell (as substitute)
Petteril Bank Community Centre Management Committee	Councillors Cape, Mrs Warwick and Wilson
Riverside Carlisle Board (NOTE: Council representatives can remain on the Riverside Board for a maximum of 9 years. Appointments or removals have been made in writing by the City Council to the Secretary of the Carlisle Housing Association Board)	Councillors Bainbridge (since 2012), one vacancy, Layden (since 2008) and Mrs Luckley (since 2012)
Settle – Carlisle Railway Development Company	Councillor Scarborough
Solway Coast Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty Joint Advisory Committee	Councillor Tickner
Solway Firth Partnership Board	One vacancy
Stanwix Community Association	Councillor Nedved
Tullie House Museum and Art Gallery Trust Board	Councillor Tickner; Councillor J Mallinson
West Coast Rail 250	Councillor Mrs Martlew
Yewdale Community Centre Committee	Councillors Bowditch, Mrs Atkinson and one vacancy
Cumbria Health and Wellbeing Board	Councillor Ms Quilter

The reason for the decision by the Executive was to make appointments to Outside Bodies for 2013/14.

The reasons given by the Members for the call-in was “Rationale of decisions”.

The call in members highlighted the following nominations and gave reasons for their concerns:

LGA Rural Commission – Two urban ward councillors had been nominated to the Rural Commission and it was understood that the Members did not attend the Rural Commission meetings. It was suggested that it would be more beneficial to appoint two rural ward councillors to the Commission.

Cumbria Health Scrutiny Committee - Health fell under the remit of Community Overview and Scrutiny Panel . The two nominations to the Committee were not Members of the Community Panel and it was felt that they should be to assist with communication between the City and County Councils.

Tullie House and Museum Art Gallery Trust Board – Councillor John Mallinson had been nominated. In cross party representations it had been traditional for the Leader of the Groups to be asked who they wished to be nominated as representative. Had Councillor Mallinson been asked who he would like to be nominated or if he would like to be nominated himself? The decision had always previously been made by the Leader of the Group.

Downagete Community Centre Management Committee – Councillor Graham had been nominated as the City Council representative he had, however, also been nominated to the Committee by the County Council as well which resulted in him representing two authorities.

The Deputy Leader; and Economy and Enterprise Portfolio Holder responded to each of the Panels concerns. He clarified that the rationale behind the nominations had not changed from that of previous Leaders and nominations had been made based on the Members position ie Leader or Ward Member or based on the individual's specific relationship to that community. The late Leader of the Council had made most of the nominations and he had put a lot of thought into the nominations.

He then responded to each of the Panels concerns:

Tullie House and Museum Art Gallery Trust Board – It was understood that Professor Hendry had a lot of respect for Councillor Mallinson and he had felt that the representation on the Tullie House Board should include the Leader of the Conservative Group to move the Board on to the next stage.

Councillor Mallinson was in attendance at the meeting and commented that Professor Hendry had discussed the nominations for Tullie House with him several times but had not reached a conclusion. Professor Hendry had wanted a Conservative member to be a representative on Tullie House and the last discussion had suggested that the nomination should be the Leader of Deputy Leader or the Group alongside the Leader or Deputy Leader of the Council and the relevant Portfolio Holder but there had not been a resolution.

Downagate Community Centre Management Committee – He reminded the Panel that the nominations on outside bodies helped Councillors support those that they represented. Councillor Graham had previously campaigned to get funding for Downagate alongside support from Councillor Mrs Parsons. Councillor Graham had approached the Conservative Group when the funding had been secured to become a representative and he had received a poor response. The Community Centre sat close to the border of two wards and served both of the wards. It was felt that it had been unfair to have only one ward represented so Councillor Graham had been appointed in 2012 in the hope that another opportunity came up that would ensure Councillor Mrs Parsons was also on the Committee. Councillor Mrs Parson had been invited by Downagate to join the committee as a co-opted member, however, not as a City Council representative. The Portfolio Holder had not been aware that Councillor Graham had also been nominated to the Committee by Cumbria County Council.

A Member commented that he had felt it was wrong not to have the Ward Councillor as the representative on Downagate Community Centre Committee and felt that this was the opportunity for the Executive to reconsider their decision and have Councillors Mrs Parsons as the City Council representative and Councillor Graham as the County Council representative.

The Deputy Leader; and Economy and Enterprise Portfolio Holder explained that, due the death of the Leader, a further report on representative on outside bodies would be taken to a future meeting of the Executive to appoint to vacancies.

Cumbria Health Scrutiny Committee – Councillor Bowditch had nominated due to his vast experience and knowledge in health and with young people. The appointment had been based on his skills, knowledge and experience.

A Member commented that health was a subject frequently considered by the Community Overview and Scrutiny Panel and she felt that it would be helpful to have a Community Member as the representative to provide up to date information to the Panel.

The Deputy Leader; and Economy and Enterprise Portfolio Holder reminded the Panel that they were able to ask Councillor Bowditch to attend Scrutiny just as they did with officers and Portfolio Holders.

LGA Rural Commission – He was aware that the nominations were both urban members and he assured the Panel that the rural area was just as important as the urban area. It was felt that the LGA needed representation from the Executive to ensure a two way flow of information between the LGA and the Council. He took on board the information regarding attendance and agreed to look into the matter further. If the representation did change it would be important to ensure that information is fed back from the LGA.

RESOLVED – That the matter be referred back to the Executive for reconsideration and that the Executive be asked to ensure that the observations and comments of the Panel be taken into consideration when appointments are being made to outside bodies.

(The meeting ended at 11.25am)